1. Roll Call
   Tom Crawford (acting City Administrator), Bob Guenzel, Roger Hewitt, Marie Klopf, Joan Lowenstein, Al McWilliams, John Mouat, Rishi Narayan, Keith Orr, Sandi Smith, John Splitt, Phil Weiss

2. Audience Participation (4 people maximum, 4 minutes each)

3. AAATA Service Changes & Impact to Downtown – N. Shore

4. TDM Study Findings- T. Brown

5. Reports from City Boards and Commissions
   - Ray Detter, Downtown Area Citizens Advisory Council

6. DDA Members Communications

7. Executive Director Communications

8. Approval of Minutes: March 2016 meetings

9. Subcommittee Reports
   a. Operations Committee – J. Splitt, K. Orr
      - Monthly parking & transportation report
      - Nelson/Nygaard study recommendations – next steps
      - Construction - 4th & William Improvements Project Update
      - Parking system review - status
      - Next Committee meeting: Wednesday, April 27 at 11am

   b. Finance Committee – M. Klopf
      - Recommendation to separate funds for future parking system expansions
      - Review of DDA expense policies
      - Review of DDA ten year plan
      - Next Committee meeting: Tuesday, April 26 at 1pm

   c. Capital Improvements Committee – J. Mouat
      - S. U. project - status
      - Fifth/Detroit project – status
      - Next Committee meeting: Wednesday, April 20 at 11am
d. Partnerships/Economic Development Committee – J. Lowenstein & A. McWilliams
    · Next Committee meeting: Wednesday April 13 at 9am

e. Executive Committee – R. Hewitt, R. Narayan, M. Klopf, S. Smith, J. Mouat
    · Next Committee meeting: Wednesday, May 4 at 11am

8. New Business

9. Other Audience Participation (4 minutes each)

10. Adjournment
Place:     DDA Office, 150 S. Fifth Avenue, Suite 301, Ann Arbor, 48104
Time:    Mr. Hewitt called the meeting to order at 12:02 p.m.

1. ROLL CALL

Present:    Tom Crawford (acting City Administrator), Bob Guenzel, Roger Hewitt, Al McWilliams, John Mouat, Rishi Narayan, Keith Orr, John Splitt, Phil Weiss
Absent:   Joan Lowenstein, Marie Klopf, Sandi Smith
Staff:    Susan Pollay, Executive Director
            Joseph Morehouse, Deputy Director
            Amber Miller, Planning & Research Specialist
            Jada Hahlbrock, Management Assistant
            Liz Rolla, Project Manager
Audience:  Ray Detter, CAC
            Joe McKibben, Republic Parking System
            Ralph Mocerino, CH2M
            Nancy Shore, getDowntown

2. AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION

None

3. PRESENTATION ON THE CONNECTOR STUDY

Mr. Hewitt shared a presentation on the Connector Study. Proposed route, project timeline and cost estimates are now on a Connector website (http://aaconnector.com/). Questions were asked and answered. Mr. Hewitt invited everyone to a public meeting about the Connector at 11am on Thursday, March 24th at the downtown branch of the Ann Arbor Public Library.

4. REPORTS FROM CITY BOARDS AND COMMISSIONS

Downtown Area Citizens Advisory Council- Mr. Detter said Megan Masson-Minock of ENP Associates attended the CAC meeting seeking feedback on proposed changes to the downtown zoning premium ordinance. Those attending the CAC meeting generally supported the proposed amendments.

Mr. Detter said Eric Grimm from the CORE Group and one of his architects, Joshua Sacks, were also at the meeting to hear comments about their proposed development on the Library Lot. The CAC shared their opinion that any development on the Library Lot must provide
connectivity with Liberty Plaza, the Blake Transit Center, the former YMCA lot, the Allen Creek Greenway, the District Library, and nearby historic and residential properties.

Mr. Detter said CAC members also discussed CORE group’s plan for the proposed project at 603 E. Huron before adjourning their meeting to attend a public hearing on the project.

5. **DDA MEMBERS COMMUNICATIONS**

   Mr. Crawford said that the new Community Services Area Administrator, Derek Delacourt, began work with the City on Monday.

   Mr. Crawford said the DDA may receive a request from City Council regarding the recent changes to some loading zones establishing after hours taxi stands. The initial request came from the City’s taxicab Board, but Council members have received negative public feedback since the change and may request action by the DDA to revert to the old signage.

6. **EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR COMMUNICATIONS**

   Ms. Pollay said that work is underway in the DDA office to reconfigure work spaces and maximize storage.

   Ms. Pollay said that Ms. Hahlbrock recently attended Michigan Municipal League training on the Open Meetings Act. Ms. Pollay reminded everyone that email communications between DDA members should not include discussions about DDA business or upcoming votes.

   Ms. Pollay said the Nelson Nygaard TDM/Parking Management document is now on the DDA website. Included in the report are recommended strategies to manage parking demand in support of a vibrant downtown. This includes a set of recommendations regarding enforcement, including pushing hours later into the evening, and being more strategic about enforcement practices such as escalating fees and first-time forgiveness. At their next meeting, the Operations Committee will consider all of the Nelson/Nygaard recommendations and formulate an action plan. She wanted the board to be aware that pursuing some recommendations may involve opening up the DDA/City parking agreement, and if so, she would keep Board members informed of discussions.

7. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

   Mr. Guenzel moved and Mr. Orr supported approval of the February 2016 DDA meeting minutes.

   A vote on the motion showed:

   **AYES:** Crawford, Guenzel, Hewitt, McWilliams, Mouat, Narayan, Orr, Splitt, Weiss

   **NAYS:** none

   **ABSENT:** Klopf, Lowenstein, Smith
The motion carried

8. A. SUBCOMMITTEE REPORTS – CAPITAL IMPROVEMENTS COMMITTEE

Resolution: S. U. Project Budget. Mr. Mouat moved and Mr. Orr supported the following:

RESOLUTION TO MODIFY THE PROJECT BUDGET FOR THE SOUTH UNIVERSITY STREETSCAPE PROJECT

Whereas, The DDA’s Development Plan highlighted identity, infrastructure, and transportation as key strategies, and included references to maintaining previous DDA improvement projects, and enhancing pedestrian connectivity and safety;

Whereas, The DDA undertook improvements on South University, between East University and Washtenaw in 1989 and many of these elements now need to be addressed;

Whereas, On October 7th, 2015, The DDA Board approved a total project budget for a South University project of $1.5M so that maintenance issues such as broken planters, ponding water, and heaving pavers could be comprehensively addressed;

Whereas, Through extensive evaluation and discussion with City staff it has become clear that pedestrian crossings, light levels, and urban forestry components of the original improvement do not meet current standards and best practices within the Downtown Street Design Manual, and must also be addressed;

Whereas, It is estimated that an additional $600,000 will be needed to:
- Install bump-outs and other pedestrian safety elements at both the Forest and Washtenaw intersections
- Widen the mid-block sidewalk to allow for street trees and improved storm water management
- Replace the current globe fixtures with updated technology that will improve light levels;

Whereas, The DDA Finance Committee reviewed the budget impacts for this cost increase, and the Capital Improvements Committee recommends Board Approval of these additional project elements;

Resolved, The DDA Board approves a budget increase of $600,000, for a total project budget of $2.1M;

Resolved, The DDA Capital Improvements Committee will bring the DDA subsequent resolutions to initiate and approve construction services.
Mr. Mouat said the project consultants shared with Committee project scope options for consideration. The committee selected some items that they felt should be added to the project scope to help the project meet current city standards. Mr. Mouat said the proposed $600,000 increase would bring the total project budget to $2.1 million. He said this would enable the project to include elements such as: wider sidewalks in the midblock sections to allow for street trees, intersection improvements at Forest and Washtenaw to make crossings more safe for pedestrians, and modifications to existing light poles for improved lighting.

A vote on the resolution showed:
AYES: Crawford, Guenzel, Hewitt, McWilliams, Mouat, Narayan, Orr, Splitt, Weiss
NAYS: none
ABSENT: Klopf, Lowenstein, Smith
The resolution carried.

5th & Detroit Project Status. Mr. Mouat said the agreement has been signed and the design kickoff will take place later in the month.

The next Capital Improvements Committee meeting will be March 16th at 11:00 a.m.

8. B. SUBCOMMITTEE REPORTS- OPERATIONS COMMITTEE
Mr. Orr moved and Mr. Mouat supported the following resolution.

RESOLUTION PROVIDING FUNDING FOR THE GO!PASS, SUPPLEMENTAL TRANSIT SERVICE, AND THE GETDOWNTOWN PROGRAM FOR FY 2017

Whereas, The getDowntown program was go-created by the DDA in 1999 and remains a partnership between the DDA, AATA and the City of Ann Arbor to provide transportation assistance to downtown employers, including the distribution of the DDA’s go!Pass;

Whereas, In support of its mission the DDA has provided funding for go!Passes and the getDowntown Program since 2001;

Whereas, The DDA Operations Committee recommends approval of the funding request for FY 2017 for the getDowntown program, go!Pass, and other transportation programs as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program or Service for Downtown Workers</th>
<th>FY 2016 Request</th>
<th>FY 2017 Request</th>
<th>Request Purpose/Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>getDowntown</td>
<td>$40,000</td>
<td>$95,000</td>
<td>TDM marketing to encourage employees to use a variety of options to get to work. Additional funds requested for Commuter/Employer survey and new website with added</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Go!Pass | $610,600 | $562,737 | Transit incentive for employees that increases bus use and frees up parking spaces for other users. Estimated decrease in ridership of 5% based on current trends.
---|---|---|---
Route 4 & 5 support | $76,600 | $76,600 | Routes with highest ridership for downtown employees. Important link to Ypsilanti talent pool.
Route 5 support | $16,992 | $17,400 | Route used by significant numbers of downtown employees. Important link to Ypsilanti talent pool. 2.5% estimated cost of living increase to reflect the change in operator wages.
NightRide go!Pass discount | $21,000 | $12,000 | Extremely important service for evening employees who depend on transit to get to work. Decreased amount needed because of increased evening bus service.
ExpressRide go!Pass discount | $5,000 | $5,000 | Encourages downtown employees to use transit rather than driving to work alone.
TOTAL | $748,200 | $751,337 | 

Whereas, The DDA is charged only for actual usage of the go!Pass, and the NightRide and ExpressRide discounts, thus the amounts shown above are maximum/not-to-exceed amounts;

RESOLVED, The DDA approves funding for the transportation services and programs listed above, with funds coming from the DDA’s Fiscal Year 2017 (063) Parking Funds.

Mr. Orr reviewed each item and answered questions. He said that the Committee recommends approval of the resolution.

A vote on the resolution showed:
AYES: Crawford, Guenzel, Hewitt, Mouat, Narayan, Orr, Splitt, Weiss
NAYS: none
ABSTAIN: McWilliams
ABSENT: Klopf, Lowenstein, Smith
The resolution carried.

Resolution: Parking Operator Management Incentive. Mr. Orr moved and Mr. Mouat supported the following resolution.

RESOLUTION TO APPROVE A 2015 YEAR-END MANAGEMENT FEE FOR REPUBLIC PARKING FOR MANAGEMENT OF DDA PARKING FACILITIES

Whereas, The DDA entered into a contract with Republic Parking Systems (RPS) beginning February 1, 2007 for management of the DDA’s parking system;
Whereas, According to this contract RPS’s $200,000 management fee is to be paid in two parts. The first $150,000 is paid on a monthly basis with the remaining amount to be paid at the year-end as a management incentive based on quantifiable criteria;

Whereas, After reviewing RPS’s performance, and in acknowledgement of their efforts this year, especially the ones above and beyond their contracted obligations, the Operations Committee recommends that the DDA provide RPS with a $45,000 year-end management incentive;

RESOLVED, The DDA authorized a 2015 year-end management incentive of $45,000 for Republic Parking Systems.

Mr. Orr reported that while a few of the measured components of the review went down slightly, in general the overall assessment was positive. He noted that the customer service sample size keeps getting smaller, possibly because surveying is done so often. Mr. Orr said the Committee recommends the DDA approve $45,000 out of the possible $50,000.

A vote on the resolution showed:
AYES: Crawford, Guenzel, Hewitt, McWilliams, Mouat, Narayan, Orr, Weiss
NAYS: none
ABSTAIN: Splitt
ABSENT: Klopf, Lowenstein, Smith
The resolution carried.

Nelson/Nygaard Study. Mr. Orr said the report is on the DDA website. Implementation planning will begin at the next meeting.

Parking & Transportation Report. Mr. Splitt asked for questions.

4th & William. Mr. Splitt said footings for the new elevator tower are nearly complete. Steel columns for the new elevator shaft are scheduled to be onsite next week.

The next Operations Committee meeting will be March 30th at 11:00 a.m.

8. C. SUBCOMMITTEE REPORTS- FINANCE COMMITTEE

Resolution: Recommend the FY 2017 Budget. Mr. Narayan moved and Mr. Splitt supported the following resolution.

RESOLUTION TO PUT FORWARD THE DDA BUDGET FOR FISCAL YEAR 2017

Whereas, The DDA has developed a Ten-Year Financial Plan, including projected income and expenses for debt service, capital improvements projects and parking operations;
Whereas, The DDA Finance Committee has developed a budget for the 2017 fiscal year for the DDA based on the DDA’s most recent Ten-Year Plan;

Whereas, Among its recommendations the DDA Finance Committee recommends that the DDA no longer set aside funds for an ambassador program in its 2017 budget;

Whereas, The Finance Committee recommends approval of this DDA budget by the DDA;

RESOLVED, The DDA accepts the recommendation of its Finance Committee and puts this budget forward to the City for approval.

Mr. Narayan reviewed key changes in the budget including a projected increase in TIF revenues and an increase for the South University project. He said the Committee is aware that this proposed budget will require the use of fund balance, but the fund balances will still be at acceptable levels.

Mr. Narayan noted that a previous DDA resolution required $150,000 be set aside for contractual services (ambassadors), but this resolution calls for redirecting those funds elsewhere. He also noted that the DDA was voting on the DDA budget as shown in the City budget format.

A vote on the resolution showed:
AYES: Crawford, Guenzel, Hewitt, McWilliams, Mouat, Narayan, Orr, Splitt, Weiss
NAYS: none
ABSENT: Klopf, Lowenstein, Smith
The resolution carried.

Review of costs for credit card processing. Mr. Narayan said the Committee reviewed the bids for services from possible credit card processors, but recommended no change.

8. D. SUBCOMMITTEE REPORTS - PARTNERSHIPS COMMITTEE

Review of DDA Grant Guidelines and Processes. Mr. McWilliams said the Committee reviewed the recently completed DDA Grant process. He said the Committee would appreciate hearing from the full board any suggestions for ways to make the grant approval process better next year.

Mr. McWilliams also noted that there are many vacancies on City Board and Commissions and that anyone with an interest or a recommendation should reach out to the Mayor’s office.

The next Partnerships Committee meeting will take place on March 9th at 9:00 am and will include DDA members as well as representatives from our partners organizations.
8. E. SUBCOMMITTEE REPORTS – EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

Mr. Hewitt said there was nothing to report.

The next Executive Committee meeting will be April 6th at 11 am.

9. NEW BUSINESS

Mr. Crawford said that the DDA reaching its TIF cap is a significant event. He said the DDA has played an important role in economic development downtown and thanked the Board members for their work. He said he is anticipating a more consistent level of growth going forward, which may allow for easier budgeting and project planning.

Mr. Crawford referenced Ms. Pollay’s comments earlier in the meeting, and said he is happy to help facilitate a dialogue regarding the City/DDA parking agreement.

10. OTHER AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION

Ms. Shore thanked the DDA Board for their continued support of the getDowntown program. She said the go!Pass is a very important tool for many downtown businesses and the DDA’s commitment to downtown employees is appreciated. She said some of the FY 2017 funding will be put towards a new web interface for go!Pass program participants.

11. ADJOURNMENT

There being no other business, Mr. Orr moved and Mr. Mouat supported a motion to adjourn. Mr. Hewitt declared the meeting adjourned at 1:24 pm.

Respectfully submitted,
Susan Pollay, Executive Director
ANN ARBOR DOWNTOWN DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY
Executive Committee Meeting
Wednesday, March 2, 2016

Place:    DDA Office, 150 S. Fifth Avenue, Suite 301, Ann Arbor, 48104
Time:     11:10 a.m.
Present:  Roger Hewitt, Rishi Narayan, Susan Pollay (ex officio),
Absent:   Marie Klopf, John Mouat (ex officio), Sandi Smith
Others:   None

Committee actions and discussions

Agenda Review. The group reviewed the March DDA monthly meeting agenda.

There being no other business, the meeting adjourned at 11:30 a.m.
Susan Pollay, Executive Director
ANN ARBOR DOWNTOWN DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY
PARTNERSHIPS & ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES
WEDNESDAY, MARCH 9, 2016

Place: DDA Office, 150 S. Fifth Avenue, Suite 301, Ann Arbor, 48104
Time: 9:00 a.m.
Present: Bob Guenzel, Joan Lowenstein, Keith Orr, Sandi Smith
Absent: Tom Crawford, Roger Hewitt, Marie Klopf, Al McWilliams, John Mouat, Rishi Narayan, John Splitt, Phil Weiss
Others: Sabra Briere/City; Amanda Carlisle/Washtenaw Housing Alliance; Jane Lumm/City; Jeremy Peters/Planning Commission; Chris White/AAATA
Staff: Susan Pollay, Amber Miller, Jada Hahlbrock
Public: Ray Detter

1. Partner Updates
AAATA- Mr. White provided information on national and local ridership trends. He also shared information on the May 2016 service expansion and how that will impact downtown.

City Council- Ms. Lumm said citizens expressed concern about the loss of free parking due to some loading zones now being used after 6pm as taxi stands, and Council will consider a resolution asking to reverse or modify this change. Ms. Lumm conveyed a citizen concern about a parking rate change; Ms. Pollay said the DDA received recommendations to manage parking demand including suggested rate changes, but no actions are currently planned. Ms. Lumm provided an update about the 3/10 Council agenda.

Planning Commission. Mr. Peters and Ms. Briere reported on developments at 603 E Huron and 319 N Main, and an update on the commission’s discussion about possible changes to zoning premiums.

DDA- Ms. Pollay briefly reviewed current DDA projects including the improvement work at the 4th & William parking structure, and the South University and 5th & Detroit streetscape projects.

2. Discussion Items
Affordable Housing- Ms. Carlisle shared information on the role of her agency. She said one role is educating property owners and the community about the housing voucher program.

Public Comment- Mr. Detter said that the developers at 603 E. Huron followed a very inclusive process, which he hoped others would follow. He also shared Citizens Advisory Council positions on downtown parking issues.

The next Partnerships Committee meeting is scheduled for April 13th at 9:00 am.

The meeting adjourned at 11:10 am.
Respectfully submitted, Susan Pollay, Executive Director
1. Desman presentation and interview about its proposal for the DDA’s Public Parking System Operational Review. Questions were asked and answered.

2. Walker Parking presentation and interview about its proposal for the DDA’s Public Parking System Operational Review. Questions were asked and answered.

3. After the interviews, the two proposals were ranked against the goal of the project, which is to hire an outside consultant to conduct an objective assessment of parking procedures so that recommendations for any changes can be used during a future parking management RFP process. The group noted that both consultant teams stated that this would be a unique assignment because the DDA’s parking operations are exceptionally well-run, but the benefit would be validation of operational processes, but also information about other parking systems to benchmark against in the future.

4. After the proposals were ranked, the fee proposals were opened.

5. At the conclusion of the discussion, the group consensus was to put Walker Parking forward as its preferred consultant. Staff were asked to follow up with Walker to ask that they put forward a revised proposal for consideration by the Operations Committee at its March 30th meeting.

6. Public Comment- None
FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES
Tuesday, March 29, 2016

Place: DDA Office, 150 S. Fifth Avenue, Suite 301, Ann Arbor, 48104
Time: 1:00 p.m.
Present: Roger Hewitt, Marie Klopf, John Mouat, John Splitt, Phil Weiss
Absent: Tom Crawford, Bob Guenzel, Joan Lowenstein, Al McWilliams, Rishi Narayan, Keith Orr, Sandi Smith
Staff: Susan Pollay, Joseph Morehouse, Jada Hahlbrock
Public: None

Financial Statements. The Committee reviewed the February 2016 expense listing. Questions were asked and answered.

Reimbursement Policy. The Committee reviewed the DDA Reimbursement Policy and made changes.

Restricting Funds. The Committee discussed a recommendation to begin setting aside some portion of parking funds for future parking system expansions. Mr. Morehouse said that dollars could be committed to this use by Board resolution and would be labeled as such on the DDA Parking Fund statements. The Committee discussed the concept, and by consensus supported the idea, saying that they felt it was important to begin to earmark funds for the next parking expansion effort, whatever that may be. Exploration of this idea will continue at the next committee meeting, including consideration of the first dollar amount to commit. Once the idea has been more fully developed it will be presented to the full board.

10-Year Plan Review. The Committee reviewed the current version of the DDA 10 year plan. Discussion included a review of the basic assumptions the 10 year plan is based on, as well as current revenue projections given that the DDA is projected to hit the TIF cap this year. Questions were asked and answered about upcoming and future projects, and bond debt.

Budget Process Update. Ms Pollay said that she and Mr. Morehouse had a budget work session with City Council on March 14th.

Next Meeting. Tuesday, April 26, 2016 at 1:00 pm

Public Comment. None

The meeting adjourned at 3:10 pm
Susan Pollay, Executive Director
Place: DDA Office, 150 S. Fifth Avenue, Suite 301, Ann Arbor, 48104
Time: 11:00 a.m.
Present: Bob Guenzel, Roger Hewitt, Joan Lowenstein, Keith Orr, John Splitt, Phil Weiss
Absent: Tom Crawford, Marie Klopf, Al McWilliams, John Mouat, Rishi Narayan, Sandi Smith
Staff: Susan Pollay, Joseph Morehouse, Amber Miller, Jada Hahlbrock
Others: Joe McKibbon/Republic Parking; Nancy Shore/getDowntown; Tom Brown/Nelson Nygaard
Public: Ray Detter, Mike Martin, Mary Steffek Blaske, Maura Thomson, Ed Vielmetti

Public Comment
Mr. Martin said the Nelson/Nygaard study includes private and public parking lots that could be developed in the future and to think about how that would impact public parking supply and demand.

Mary Steffek Blaske commented on the list of Nelson/Nygaard study recommendations, said that extending meter enforcement hours would negatively impact Symphony guests, as they would be forced to worry about expiring meters during the show. She also said that a 20% rate increase on monthly permits would be too steep.

Ed Vielmetti also commented on these recommendations, and said he supports shifting the hours of enforcement later, in particular, a later morning start to meter enforcement. He said changes to time limits might be complicated to communicate.

Maura Thomson also commented on this list of recommendations, and said a 50% rate increase for meters in prime locations was steep, and should be implemented over time. She said any changes should be undertaken with the accompanying supportive strategies as recommended in the report. She said a robust communication plan would be important.

Nelson Nygaard Study Recommendation
Mr. Brown from Nelson Nygaard shared a presentation highlighting findings and recommendations from Nelson/Nygaard TDM/parking study, including a parking demand analysis, demand projections, and recommended TDM strategies. Among the recommendations are three areas of focus and accompanying goals, each of which as several interconnected actions steps:
1. Improve Short Term Access: Consistent availability and better customer experience
2. Improve Farmers Market Access: Improve parking and access for Farmers Market
3. Expand Commuter Options: Increase permit availability and expand options/awareness

There were several questions asked by committee members and answered by Mr. Brown.

Parking & Transportation Report
The Committee reviewed the March report, and questions were asked and answered. Among other
updates, the annual spring maintenance plans for the structures and meters were reviewed, getDowntown shared updates on their upcoming events, and Ms. Miller reviewed bike parking installations. The recent City Council resolution regarding taxi stands was also discussed.

The Committee expressed support to move forward with the purchase of new equipment to be able to expand the Quick Pay parking card option to the Library Lane and Liberty Square facilities.

**4th & William.** Mr. Splitt said the steel for Phase II has been installed. Some minor alignment corrections need to happen but should not impact the overall schedule significantly.

**Parking System Review.** Given that it was almost 1:00 pm it was decided that discussion about this topic would wait until the April committee meeting.

**New Business.** Mr. Hewitt said he attended a steering committee meeting for the North-South rail line. He said that conflicting views on who the service will benefit may mean that the first phase of the project may be limited to Washtenaw County.

Ms. Pollay said the RTA is having an open house at Shinola on Main Street on March 31 to present information about their planning for public transportation connecting Ann Arbor/Ypsilanti with Detroit.

**Public Comment** Mr. Vielmetti said that on rainy days he has been noticing several areas, especially in the Farmers Market area, that have quite a bit of pooling and flooding on the sidewalks. He will share the locations with DDA next time he encounters these pooling areas.

**Next Operations Committee Meeting:** April 27 at 11:00 am

The meeting adjourned at 1:10 pm.
Susan Pollay, Executive Director
Parking Operations

**Special Events In March**
Ann Arbor Film Festival
Shamrocks and Shenanigans 5K

**Special Event Meter Bag Fee Waivers in March**
Shamrocks and Shenanigans 5K 3/13/16 $320 (plus use of S. Ashley lot on a Sunday)
A2SO Student Concert 3/16/16 $200
Ann Arbor Film Festival 3/15/16 – 3/20/16 (15 permit passes at Liberty Square for 1 week)

**Personnel Changes**
Katherine Beaty from Republic Parking’s corporate office is temporarily in Ann Arbor to oversee the accounting and administration department while its manager, Samara Martin is on maternity leave. Joe McKibbon continues to serve as the Interim General Manager while Dave Orfield is on medical leave.

**Meters**
The meter department is planning spring preventative maintenance on the meters. The E-park will be cleaned internally and externally, along with touch up painting of the exteriors where needed. The printer and other components will be inspected. The single-head meters will have their 9 volt batteries changed and are externally cleaned and inspected. Meter bag activity is increasing with the warmer weather.

**General Operations**
The parking system’s liability insurance company, Liberty Mutual, inspected the Maynard Garage on March 7th. Liberty Mutual gave Republic Parking exemplary marks for the condition of the facility and their maintenance and operational procedures. Their written report is attached.

Republic provided data on payment methods for non-entry/exit transactions for the parking system (permits, validations, meter bags). It is 87% check and 13% credit card. Of the credit card payments, 25% are done in person and 75% are done via the payment portal online.

**City/DDA Parking Enforcement Committee**
The committee will meet on March 31st. They will continue discussing the Art Fair shift to Sunday, and a request from the Hands on Museum to make the loading zone in front of the museum to 24 hours per day due to nighttime events.

The Committee will also formulate a recommendation for the DDA’s Operations Committee in response to the City Council resolution approved on March 21st: “Resolution Requesting the Downtown Development Authority (DDA) to Reconsider Permitted Uses in Commercial Loading/Taxi Stand Zones.” In this resolution, City Council requested the following:
- The DDA, after consultation with the Taxicab Board, remove the taxicab stands that are established in conjunction with commercial loading zones;
- The DDA and Taxicab Board (or a designated Taxicab Board citizen representative) reconsider, after taking into account traffic safety and operations and citizen feedback, how to best utilize the approximately 20 commercial loading zones without them being partially designated as taxicab stands;
- The DDA obtain Council feedback and inform Council of the revised plan prior to implementation.

**Tally Hall Condominium Association**
The condo administrator sent an elevator contract with Schindler Elevator to be reviewed prior to signing. The contract was modified by the DDA to ensure prompt after-hours responses.

**Parking System Maintenance**
Repairs were made to the Maynard Street structure entrance. The work included removing the old drive lane, installing a new lane counter loop, and pouring a new drive lane. The entrance was closed for 3 ½ days. Signage was in place the week prior to the work informing parkers of the upcoming work. Monthly parkers and neighbors were also notified.

The spring washdowns have been scheduled as follows:
- **Ann Ashley**: April 11 to April 21st (10 days)
- **1st & Washington**: April 10th, April 16, 17, 23, 24th (5 days) Saturday & Sunday only
  - (Due to Noise)
- **Library Lane**: April 21st to May 4th (14 days)
- **Forest Garage**: May 5th to May 14th (10 days)
- **Liberty Square**: May 15th to May 24th (10 days)
- **4th & Washington**: May 25th to May 27th (4 days)
- **Maynard**: May 28th to June 7th (10 days)
- **Fourth & William**: June 8th to June 15th (8 days)

All facility wash downs will be preceded with notices to the customers and neighbors. The typical hours of the wash downs are 6pm to 11 pm weekdays and 8 am to 11 pm on weekends. A noise permit has been obtained.

**Parking System Repairs**
The list of summer 2016 parking system repairs is as follows:
- **Library Lane** – Sealant replacement and repair
- **Ann & Ashley** - Concrete, stairs, brick repairs along with expansion joint and sealant replacement. There is also approximately 1,700 square feet of deck coating needed. This work completes the work that was begun last summer.
- **Liberty Square** – Concrete repairs, brick repair and sealant application, along with expansion joint and sealant replacement. There is also approximately 80,000 square feet of deck coating needed. This work will be the major effort this year.
This list of repairs is currently out to bid with a April 14, 2016 deadline for the bids to be turned in. The work is scheduled to start either June 1st or July 1st depending on fund availability.

**Parking Equipment**

**New equipment**
The DDA was advised that the permit equipment at the 415 W. Washington lot was on the verge of failure. A simple replacement system was estimated to cost less than $4,000. The equipment was ordered and will be installed as soon as it arrives.

The DDA requested and received a quote to install the “Quick Pay Card” system at the Liberty Square and Library Lane parking structures. The initial installation in the Fourth & Washington structure is working well, and this technology enables patrons to have a pre-paid technology option, somewhat akin to month permits, that provides a degree of convenience. The quotes for Liberty Square and Library Lane garages are $30,290 and $54,845 respectively. With committee approval the bids can be accepted, and the equipment can be installed by June 30th. There are sufficient funds in the budget for this project.

**Elevators**

There were 9 elevator service calls during the last month. They were distributed as follows:
- 2 Maynard Main Elevator
- 1 Fourth and William Alley
- 4 Fourth and Washington
- 2 Ann & Ashley South

**Electric Vehicle (EV) Charging Units**

Attached is a report provided by the DDA to the Clean Energy Coalition on the usage of EV stations in the public parking system in 2015. Through the first two quarters of 2015 the charging stations had 37,000 kWh of usage, or about 129,500 miles of electric driving. There continues to be demand from the public for the DDA to install additional EV units.

**Parking Construction**

**Fourth & William Stair/Elevator Improvement Project**

Masonry and curtain wall installation continues in the new elevator shaft. It is still anticipated that the first high-speed elevator will be in place by the end of June.

**Transportation Demand Management (TDM)**

**GetDowntown Outreach**

In March GetDowntown reached out to the following prospects about its services: Piada, Hopcat, Menna's Join

**Go!pass**

Go!pass ridership was down 8% in February. Reasons include the low gas prices, larger companies leaving downtown/going out of business, and better regulation of the go!pass.

**New go!pass companies for March**
Venture Investors, Pancheros, Tox Services, The Graduate Hotel (formerly Campus Inn)

Go!pass sales as of March 21, 2016: 6,164 passes distributed to 444 organizations

GetDowntown Updates

Commuter Challenge 2016 & May 2016 Service Changes Outreach
Promotion of the 2016 Commuter Challenge (happening May 2016) will begin at the end of March. The Commuter Challenge site is at http://commuteandwin.org

In April, getDowntown will conduct events and outreach to downtown Ann Arbor businesses regarding the May 2016 service changes. Information about the May 2016 Service Changes can be found at http://therideyourway.org. Information will be presented to the DDA at the April DDA meeting, and to the Main Street Area Association.

Best Commuting Culture Companies
In March, the getDowntown Program published a blog post highlighting the companies with the Best Commuting Culture in downtown Ann Arbor. These are companies who have at least 20% Commuter Challenge participation and at least 50% go!pass participation. The blog post is here: http://bit.ly/1QEhhZJ

Best Commuting Culture Companies List (from large to small):
- Arbor Research Collaborative for Health
- ITHAKA/Jstor
- Magnetic
- Ecology Center
- Workforce Software
- Bivouac
- Michigan Language Center
- Deepfield Networks
- Clean Water Action
- A3C Collaborative Architecture
- Ann Arbor Art Center
- Pure Visibility
- Lakeside Software
- Dawn Treader Book Shop
- Orderv
- Imagine Three
- The Greenway Collaborative
- Great Lakes Observing System
- The Mail Shoppe
- Edward Jones Investments

Bike Parking
DDA and getDowntown are working together to coordinate the seasonal on-street bike rack installations. So far, locations include:
- 4th Avenue, by the People’s Food Co-op
- Detroit Street, by Zingerman’s
· Main Street, by Mighty Good Coffee
· Liberty Street, by Bill’s Beer Garden
· State Street, by Bivouac
· North University, by Silvio’s
· Washington Street, by Babo
· South 4th Avenue, by Transition Rack

The DDA is planning to order an additional rack for use at special events this year, such as the Worst Day of the Year Ride and at the Farmer’s Market. In addition, DDA staff continue to replace rusted and damaged bike hoops, and locate new hoops.

DDA staff made the decision to remove a bike locker at Fourth and Washington in order to add more covered bike hoops at the request of a downtown company who is moving to a new location (Lakeside Software). Due to high demand at the Ann Ashley Bike House, more bike hoops were installed at that location.

**Carshare**
With the opening of the Residence Inn, two Zipcars were added to the downtown fleet. In addition, developers at 615 S. Main Street are reaching out to Zipcar and Maven with an interest in adding carshare vehicles near the development site, once complete.

**Nelson/Nygaard Demand Management Study**
Nelson/Nygaard’s reports analyze current and projected parking demand, and set forward recommended demand management (TDM) strategies to extend parking demand more broadly. These reports are available on the DDA website [http://www.a2dda.org/current-projects/tdm-analysis/](http://www.a2dda.org/current-projects/tdm-analysis/)

The Operations Committee will discuss the recommendations in this report at its next meeting on March 30th. Important areas of discussion will include managing on-street metered parking (adjusting the hours of enforcement later to align with peak demand, implement performance-based enforcement including “first time forgiveness”, expanding the epark system, and eliminating time limits after 5 or 6pm); implementing parking strategies at the Farmers Market (convert loading zones to customer pickup/drop off on market days, provide dedicated vendor parking locations to reduce parking impacts on customer access, and encourage vendors to use parking further away); and increasing monthly permit availability (increase rates, introduce discounts to facilitate TDM, freeze permits during Commuter Challenge month, and add an occasional parking benefit to go!Pass users.)
Dear Mr. Wheeler:

**Purpose**
This letter is to confirm the visit I made with you at the Maynard Parking Structure in Ann Arbor, MI (324 Maynard Street) on March 7, 2016. The purpose for my visit was to conduct a risk assessment of the Maynard Parking Structure using the “Republic Parking Observation Form”. The results of this assessment are reviewed in this letter. A copy of the completed “Republic Parking Observation Form” was provided in the same e-mail that this confirmation letter was sent to you in.

**Conclusions**

- Many impressive observations and safety practices were identified and discussed while walking through the parking structure and going through the “Republic Parking Observation Form”.
  - Policies and procedures are well enforced and adhered to, which helps to prevent claims and ensure the safety of the parking structure and those that work at the parking structure.
- Based on discussions and the results of the assessment, two improvement opportunities were identified for your management programs.
  - No recommendations were generated for the areas assessed regarding the upkeep, condition, and security of the parking structure.
- Loss history provided (for the time period from 7/1/2011 to 1/31/2016) and reviewed showed that there have been a total of 5 reported general liability claims and 2 workers’ compensation claims during this time period for the Maynard Street parking structure that the assessment was carried out on.
  - Nothing was paid out for any of the general liability claims that were made during this time period.
  - Both workers’ compensation claims combined resulted in $268 in incurred costs.
Discussion
Amongst the many impressive observations and safety practices identified, there were some in particular that I wanted to highlight. Such observations and practices include:

- Having proper signage and maintaining such signage.
- Maintaining the housekeeping for the parking structure.
- Ensuring the fencing, stairways, and handrails are in good repair.
- Having and maintaining proper lighting throughout the parking structure.
- Inspecting walking and parking surfaces and making sure they remain in good repair.
- Having security cameras and emergency call boxes.
- Providing employees with proper training, maintaining communications, and keeping proper documentation.

Included below and on the following page are some pictures that were taken of the positive observations that were made during the visit:

The three photos on this page display examples of adequate sign usage, proper maintenance, marked and operational bollards and gates, and clearly painted curbs. This was consistent throughout.
It is very evident that safety and loss prevention have been and continue to be made a priority. This commitment to safety and loss prevention is reflected in the loss history that was analyzed. No severity issues were noted. When it comes to frequency, there was only one type of claim that occurred twice (otherwise, no frequency issues were noted). This was a general liability claim that involved a claimant getting hit in the head by one of the gate arms (nothing was paid out for either claim). It was noted that there is plenty of signage and markings in place to warn others not to walk under or near the gate arms. Your practices of investigating accidents, determining root causes, and identifying corrective actions needed appear to be effectively carried out and are supportive of your safety and loss prevention/reduction efforts.

As noted, two improvement opportunities were identified as a result of the assessment. One improvement opportunity deals with rules regarding work practices and personal protective equipment and the other improvement opportunity deals with the formation of a safety committee. Recommendations were made in regards to these identified improvement opportunities to assist you in your safety and loss prevention efforts and in the enhancement of your existing management programs. These recommendations are listed in the “Recommendations” section on the following page.
**Recommendations**

| 2016-01: Written Rules for Work Practices and Personal Protective Equipment |
|---|---|---|
| **Status:** New | **Responsibility:** Ed Wheeler | **Target Date for Completion:** 10/31/2016 |
| Formalize rules regarding work practices and personal protective equipment for those that are part of the maintenance department to ensure consistency in training and to ensure there is clear communications and expectations on proper and safe work practices. It was noted that the rules regarding work practices and personal protective equipment are in writing (formalized) for some positions, such as cashiers, but, when it comes to the maintenance personnel, rules regarding work practices and personal protective equipment aren't in writing. |

| 2016-02: Safety Committee Formation |
|---|---|---|
| **Status:** New | **Responsibility:** Ed Wheeler | **Target Date for Completion:** 12/31/2016 |
| Form a safety committee and hold safety committee meetings (monthly or quarterly) in compliance with State and corporate requirements. At the time of the assessment, it was noted that no safety committee is in place. A safety committee’s purpose is to provide an open forum to discuss accidents, near-misses, recommendations for corrective action, prevention of recurrence, and opportunities for improvement. As such, safety committees are effective in helping to prevent unsafe practices and conditions, reducing the risk of injury and illness, promoting safety and health in the workplace, and motivating employees to become actively involved in the company’s safety and loss prevention efforts. Two documents that provide information on safety committees and the formation of them have been attached to this letter for guidance. These two documents are:  
- LC6204 – Organizing Your Safety Committee  
- RC290 – Safety Committees |

If you could provide a response to inform us of the actions that will be or have been taken for these recommendations, that would be great.

**Closing**

I am thankful for the time that was set aside and the courtesy that was shown. It was a pleasure meeting with you. If you have any questions regarding this letter, please feel free to contact me by phone at 517-256-5702 or by e-mail at lyndsy.smith@libertymutual.com.

Sincerely,

**Lyndsy Smith**

Lyndsy Smith ARM, CSP  
Senior Consultant
### Ann Arbor DDA Electric Car Charger Use Data - per quarter

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Parking Structure/lot</th>
<th># of chargers</th>
<th>2012</th>
<th>2013</th>
<th>2014</th>
<th>2015</th>
<th>Structure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Library Lane</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>246</td>
<td>2,060</td>
<td>2,222</td>
<td>2,623</td>
<td>2,060</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maynard</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>221</td>
<td>1,382</td>
<td>1,391</td>
<td>1,943</td>
<td>2,852</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ann Ashley</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>137</td>
<td>812</td>
<td>963</td>
<td>1,102</td>
<td>1,181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Forrest</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>1,350</td>
<td>955</td>
<td>1,301</td>
<td>2,622</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4th and William</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>257</td>
<td>1,750</td>
<td>1,660</td>
<td>1,510</td>
<td>1,868</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4th and Catherine</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>534</td>
<td>797</td>
<td>1,254</td>
<td>2,292</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1st and Washington</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>223</td>
<td>746</td>
<td>486</td>
<td>1,564</td>
<td>2,140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>23</strong></td>
<td><strong>669</strong></td>
<td><strong>7,888</strong></td>
<td><strong>9,954</strong></td>
<td><strong>11,895</strong></td>
<td><strong>14,444</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Total kWh Delivered = 192,262**

**Total Miles = 672,918**  @ 3.5 mi/kWh

**Cost of elec to DDA/mo = $494**  @ $0.113 per kWh

**Tota Elec Cost to DDA = $21,726**

---

**Ann Arbor DDA Electric Car Charger Usage**

- 1st and Washington
- 4th and Catherine
- 4th and William
- Forrest
- Ann Ashley
- Maynard
- Library Lane

**2nd quarter 2012 thru 4th quarter 2015**
Purpose: To enact a fair and auditable expense reimbursement policy for the DDA. This policy will establish those entertainment, meal, education, and other expenses, that will be reimbursed to staff and DDA board members or others, when those purchases have been determined to benefit the DDA as defined by the DDA Board or Executive Director. This policy is complimentary to the DDA Travel Policy.

Expenses that will be reimbursed with receipt are:

Office Expenses
Any necessary supplies or services that are needed to conduct DDA businesses which were not acquired through regular purchasing procedures through the DDA office, for reasons such as time constraints or ease of purchase.

Transportation
Costs of transportation needed to conduct DDA business will be reimbursed up to $1,000 without prior approval. Hired transportation or public transportation will require a receipt or published rate. Use of a personal vehicle will be reimbursed at IRS standard mileage rates in effect at the time of travel, as well as fees for parking with receipts.

Business Meals
Costs for food and beverage for DDA Board, Staff and guests that are incurred (non-travel) will be reimbursed if they are incurred for DDA purposes and are reasonable. A receipt will be required along with the purpose of the meal and a list of attendees. The cost of any alcohol will not be reimbursed.

Classes and Training
The cost of local or online work related classes and training, preapproved by the Executive Director, will be reimbursed with a receipt.

Other
The DDA Executive Director is authorized to approve other cost reimbursements as deemed necessary in support of the DDA’s mission, projects, administration, communication, and overall efforts.

Approval Process:
The approval of DDA reimbursements will be as follows:

- Each purchase or event being reimbursed will be treated separately for approval limits
- All reimbursements under $251 will be approved by the Executive Director
- Executive Director and DDA Board Member reimbursements, except the DDA Treasurer, above $250 will be approved by the DDA Treasurer
- DDA Treasurer reimbursements above $250 will be approved by the Finance Committee
Parking & TDM Report Next Steps

Since completion of the TDM report, we have continued discussing the recommendations with the getDowntown Program, Farmer’s Market, and other partners. Based on those conversations, we have summarized suggested priority action areas, below. Within an action area, recommendations are inherently linked, providing a package of strategies that support the DDA’s management goals.

ACTION AREA 1: ON-STREET METERED PARKING STRATEGIES

GOAL: Maintain consistent availability among short-term spaces and improve the user experience

On-street meters are currently enforced from 8AM to 6PM, ending precisely when the evening peak begins to develop. During the TDM Study, the parking data revealed that parking meters in the downtown core are utilized above 90%, effectively full, after 6pm.

At these times, Downtown activity is dominated by visitors, and visits are primarily focused on arts/culture, dining, socializing, and recreation. In such a context, motorists will tend to prioritize convenience over moderate cost savings, in choosing where to park. Making the most convenient spaces free at these times can be a great strategy for downtowns with struggling evening economies. In a thriving evening economy, however, this creates a conflict between expectations of free and easy curb parking and the reality that, unless one is willing to endure a prolonged search for such a space, paying to park in an off-street space is much more likely.

At the other end of the meter-enforcement schedule, short-term parking demand is typically modest until close to Noon, when the midday peak begins to develop. This provides an opportunity to shift meter-enforcement hours toward this peak, adding a meaningful period of free parking in the mornings, while extending pricing into evenings to better maintain availability at these crucial times. Such a shift will underscore the connection between pricing and demand, offering free parking when availability can still be maintained, and pricing to maintain access at all other times.

ACTIONS:

- Adjust meter schedules to align with peak demand, 10am – 10pm
- Implement performance-focused enforcement
  - Institute incremental fines
  - Include a First Time Forgiveness policy and procedures, including information-based tickets directing motorists to parking and mobility options
  - Concentrate enforcement where it is needed, focusing where availability is lacking, not necessarily where violations are most likely to occur
- Refine tiers for metered pricing based on location – add a third to create a Prime, Base, and Reduced rate
- Expand the epark system
- Adjust rates to attain/maintain availability
Annual adjustments, as needed

- Begin to eliminate time limits, begin with no time limits after 6pm
- Create a communications plan, including wayfinding

ACTION AREA 2: FARMERS MARKET STRATEGIES

GOAL: Improve parking and access for the Farmer’s Market events, particularly for attendees.

During the TDM Study, DDA Board Members had several discussions about the parking and access challenges on Farmer’s Market days. In our focus group meetings with Kerrytown businesses, they expressed a desire for improved parking function and legibility, as well. As the most frequent, high-impact events in Downtown, the Farmers Markets, held on Wednesdays and Saturdays in Kerrytown, merit a particular focus for demand management strategies.

ACTIONS:

- Convert existing loading zones to customer pickup/dropoff stations on market days.
- Provide dedicated vendor parking locations to reduce vendor parking impacts on customer access.
  - Preliminary options to consider include:
    - The loading zone on Kingsley Street at 5th Avenue
    - The rear, side lot along the north side of Community High School
- Encourage vendors to use available options that customer find less appealing, such as the lower level of the Washtenaw County lot and the Ann Ashley structure.
- Work with Washtenaw County to keep the gate arms down at the 4th & Catherine lot until 7am to encourage Market vendors/employees to park at Ann Ashley, thus keeping these free lots more available to customers
- Coordinate with parking enforcement to increase their presence in May so that they can help users to build good habits
- Pilot an event bike parking rack to allow the Farmer’s Market to expand bike parking on market days
- Work with the Farmer’s Market to communicate this package of options to vendors and customers
- Based on the impact of these strategies, develop a toolbox for special events
ACTION AREA 3: MONTHLY PARKING PERMIT STRATEGIES

GOAL: Increase permit availability, reduce the permit waitlist, and increase awareness of the go!pass and other alternative commuting options.

The most common theme that emerged during the focus group meetings with downtown businesses was a concern about the permit waitlist, particularly among firms that are quickly expanding. These same employers expressed that a downtown location was top priority for their firm and that they would be willing to pay more for a permit, if it meant increased access to permits. Along with the go!pass, employers see a parking permit as a benefit for their employee, citing that employees use the permit for non-work activities, including dining and entertainment.

During the study, we noted that businesses that experienced some wait time before obtaining a permit were more likely to be aware of and use alternative commute options. Business who located downtown when permits were readily available, such as the opening of the new Library Lane Structure, were sometimes unaware of the go!pass program all together.

As a result, some wait period prior to issuance may be ideal – but we should aim for six months, rather than years, and seek to maintain a predictable wait time.

ACTIONS:

- Increase permit rates for standard and reserved monthly permits by 20%
- Introduce discounts to facilitate TDM
  - Provide x% discount to go!pass participating businesses who agree to regular coordination meetings with the getDowntown Program, this would include creating a new employee hire plan and meetings with employees
- Continue to explore “Pay as You Go” monthly permit options
  - Currently exists at 4th & Washington
  - Equipment at Library Lane, 4th & William, and Liberty Square create opportunities to expand
- Add an “Occasional Parking” Benefit to the go!pass
  - Staff are still discussing what the appropriate annual allowance may be
- Allow commuters to freeze their permit during Commuter Challenge month
  - Year 1, capped at 50 to help refine process
- Encourage Rideshare
- Continue to partner on regional transit
City of Ann Arbor’s Library Lane Parking Garage: Beauty Meets Function

Summary

The Library Lane underground parking structure was strategically conceived to help revitalize downtown Ann Arbor’s midtown area, while encouraging new private investment and creating a stronger connection between Main Street and the University of Michigan campus. The city of Ann Arbor Downtown Development Authority wanted 761 spaces to support new business attraction, while preserving the site surface for future mixed-use development. Among the many challenges were the need to create a user-friendly facility that avoided the stereotypical below-grade parking experience and foster a welcoming environment using open structural bracing, daylighting, and other design elements. Without knowing future uses for the top, its design had to anticipate the location of future building doors, elevators, and open space; and include infrastructure for potential development.

Ann Arbor has minimal land for new parking structures, so close attention was paid to site constraints such as water table, sandy soils, and a tight construction site with active uses on all sides. Both the superstructure and 10-foot-thick mat foundation needed to accommodate future buildings and a civic plaza, with foundation walls allowing for future connections to adjacent properties and horizontal expansion. The foundation required one of Michigan’s largest continuous concrete pours (6,000 cubic yards over 36 hours). Its service alley and mid-block street also needed to serve future development.

Project Goals:

- Provide a welcoming and attractive underground structure with no sense of confinement, reduced visibility, and separation from the outside world
- Meet sustainability, durability, and operational goals
- Cope with challenging site conditions, including earth retention 80+ feet down with very sandy soils and large boulders
- Create temporary site dewatering, directing water uphill six blocks
- Provide a fire protection system that would allow stairwells to remain open
- Provide a useful life of 75 years before major structural repair is required
- Remove nearly 190,000 CY of sandy soil

Approximate cost or budget: $50,000,000, including the non-parking elements such as the supported roadways, structural capacity for the future building development, and future building services.

Challenges/Obstacles Overcome:

- Conditions included a tight site with adjacent buildings, granular soils, and construction below the water table. To solve these issues:
  - A temporary earth-retention system was required to retain the soil loads, resist adjacent building surcharge loading, and reduce dewatering volume requirements
  - A mat foundation system, over 10 ft. thick in some locations, was designed to support a 20-story building. To complete its installation required dewatering to a depth of up to 15 ft. below the static groundwater elevation
  - To accommodate the project schedule required one of the largest continuous urban concrete pours in Michigan – some 6,000 CY of concrete during two days in February

The Library Lane parking structure has helped attract new tech businesses downtown and developer interest in future mixed-use development.
Providing natural light in a four-level, below-grade structure required:
- Design of precast concrete light wells with stainless steel mirrors to act as light cannons to the first level
- Design of large, open, curved stairs with glass canopies to bring natural light to the lowest levels
- High ceilings stained white
- Flat floors and unobstructed lines-of-sight
- Uniform lighting
- Glass-backed elevators to add to the sense of openness

Addressing security for pedestrian safety required:
- A snowmelt system and segregated pedestrian walkways
- Security features including emergency phones, a cellular repeater system, and CCTV cameras
- Staffed cashiering and a 24-hour operations office at the lowest level to further emphasize safety

Sustainability investment/features:
Recognized as a “Green Parking Council Demonstrator Site,” it reused the 190,000-cubic yards of soil removed during construction and used recycled concrete and steel, as well as energy-efficient LED and fluorescent lighting. Its six electric-vehicle stations are now in regular use; an oversized storm water detention system at the lowest level contains a 305,000-gallon tank.

Innovative/creative solutions or processes developed that may help others in the industry:
- Natural light was an important design element
- Precast concrete light wells with stainless steel mirrors act as light cannons to the first level
- Large, open curved stairs with glass canopies bring natural light to the lowest levels
- High ceilings stained white, flat floors, and unobstructed lines-of-sight help expand impact
- Long-span, post-tensioned concrete construction reduced the number of columns, while steel-braced frames and concrete shear walls with punched openings provide the lateral bracing to receive future development and unbalanced soil loads
- Bright uniform lighting and glass-backed elevators add to the sense of openness

Additional information:
Much of the grade level superstructure was designed to carry AASHTO bridge loads and the portion of the structure supporting 5th Avenue (an Ann Arbor truck route) is a registered bridge with the Michigan Department of Transportation.

Consultants:
- Carl Walker, Inc., Prime Consultant, Structural Engineer, Parking Consultant
- Luckenbach Ziegelman Architects, PLLC, Architectural Consultant
- Beckett & Raeder, Inc., Site Planning & Landscape Architect
- Park Avenue Consultants, Owner Representative
- Civil Engineering Consultant Midwestern Consulting, Civil Engineering & Traffic Consultant
- Berbiglia Associates, Inc., Electrical/Mechanical/Plumbing Consultant
- Christman Company, Construction Manager

Project manager:
Michael Ortlieb, P.E., Executive Vice-President, Carl Walker, Inc.
5136 Lovers Lane, Suite 200, Kalamazoo, MI 49002
(269) 381-2222 | mortlieb@carlwalker.com
www.carlwalker.com
The University of Michigan recently released its plans for the Ann Arbor Connector: a proposed light rail transit system that would connect U-M’s three campus hubs—north, central and south campus within the City of Ann Arbor.
The questions about where, when and how much have been covered (here, here and here), but I couldn’t help but wonder… why does this project make sense in Ann Arbor, a modest-sized city in a state where culture around public transit has lots of room for improvement?

The answer is simple. The University of Michigan.

College campuses are the epitome of traditional urban design, planning and architecture and are one of the few places outside major cities like New York and Washington D.C. where owning a car is not just optional, it’s highly impractical. For the same reasons that an auto-dependent lifestyle is atypical, public transit works great in these places.

Let me break down the three main reasons why college campuses and light rail are a match made in urban planning heaven:

**Density.** With so many students, faculty and staff members living in close proximity to one another—whether it be in a dorm on campus or in a house or apartment nearby—the density of people means that there are enough riders to support light rail, which requires a large amount of riders to be efficient.

Transit is particularly important in college towns where the campus is split among a few major hubs. If the University of Michigan was made up of one large campus where all of the activity took place and everything was within relative walking distance, public transit might not be required. However, like many schools, the campus is split up into a few large hubs, creating a need to frequently travel between those hubs—north, central and south campus.

**There’s a mixture of uses.** Another thing that makes campus life such a great match for light rail is that places to live, study, work and have fun are all mixed together. Driving and parking a half dozen different places throughout your day from home, work, school, appointments and to run errands isn’t necessary.

For example, a person can take a train from their apartment in the morning to work, walk to lunch or a meeting, and take a train home—stopping at the store between the station and their apartment. Transit works better with this setup because you can get much more out of each trip.
It’s easy, safe and comfortable to walk. One of my favorite transportation planning rules is, “every time you’re a transit user, you’re also a pedestrian.” College campuses are designed with a focus on walkways, green spaces and minimal interaction between walkers and vehicular traffic. Light rail looks much more attractive when you know that walking to and from the station will be safe and comfortable.

Take these three points, pair them with a bus system that is already maxed out, and light rail makes a lot of sense.

In case you hadn’t guessed it, using light rail to connect college campuses isn’t a new idea. In St. Louis, the Metrolink light rail connects the University of Missouri North Campus, the St. Louis College of Pharmacy and the Washington University Medical School. The light rail system in Houston, Texas also connects a bunch of campuses in the area. And these are two examples of many.

How can you get involved?

Project partners—the University of Michigan, the City of Ann Arbor and the Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority—all say that public engagement will be a key component to moving the concept forward.

There are already two public meetings scheduled later this month to discuss the project. Here are the details:

**AA Connector Public Meetings**

**Thursday, March 24, 2016**

11 AM to 1 PM at the [Ann Arbor Downtown District Library](#) on Fifth Ave. and

6 to 8 PM at the [Traverwood Branch Library](#)

You can also visit the [AA Connector website](#) to learn more and click on “Connect” to join the project email list to stay up-to-date on all of the project’s happenings.