Place: DDA Office  
301 E. Liberty, Suite 690  
Ann Arbor, MI 48104

Time: The Chair, Ed Shaffran, called the meeting to order at 12:10 p.m.

1. Roll Call

Present: Ron Dankert, Dave DeVarti, David Fritz, Leah Gunn, Maria Harshe, Karl Pohrt, Deanna Relyea, Ed Shaffran, Lorri Sipes, Skip Ungrodt

Absent: Neal Berlin, Bob Gillett

Staff: Susan Pollay, Executive Director

Present: Joseph Morehouse, Fiscal and Administrative Manager

Audience: Jerry Billiter, National Garages  
Ray Detter, Citizens Advisory Council  
Bob Frazier, National Garages  
Bob Henderson, Citizens Advisory Council  
Adrian Iraola, City Engineering  
Donna Johnson, City Planning Department  
Audrey Libke, Citizens Advisory Council  
Cathy O'Donnell, Ann Arbor News  
Roger Pothus, Owner, Renaissance  
Dick Stoll, Citizen  
Andrew L. Wright, Citizens Advisory Council

2. Approval of Minutes

Ms. Harshe made a motion, and Ms. Sipes seconded, that the minutes of the November 12, 1998 meeting be approved.

A vote on the motion showed:

AYES: Dankert, DeVarti, Fritz, Gunn, Harshe, Pohrt, Relyea, Shaffran, Sipes, Ungrodt

NAYS: None

Absent: Berlin, Gillett

The motion carried.
3. Citizens Advisory Council

4. Audience Participation
Dick Stoll addressed the Board about the visual impact of the proposed Forest Parking Structure. He expressed concerns that the current plan would not allow for an aesthetically pleasing facility, and suggested that engineering an underground parking facility was fairly simple and commonly done.

Roger Pothus, owner of Renaissance, spoke in favor of the billboard marking effort proposed jointly by the State Street and Main Street Area Associations, with financial support from the Ann Arbor Convention and Visitors Bureau.

5. New Business
With the DDA holding its meetings at 12:00 noon, Ms. Gunn moved and Ms. Harshe seconded a resolution to limit DDA audience participation to four people maximum for four minutes each at the beginning of the meeting to allow for ample discussion of items on DDA agendas. Ms. Gunn said that others wishing to address the Board would be allocated time near the conclusion of the meeting, and that individuals wishing to speak should register in advance with Ms. Pollay.

A vote on the motion showed:

**AYES:** Dankert, DeVarti, Fritz, Gunn, Harshe, Pohrt, Relyea, Shaffran, Sipes, Ungrodt
**NAYS:** None
**Absent:** Berlin, Gillett

The motion carried.

**Parking Operations**
Ms. Gunn moved and Mr. Ungrodt seconded the following resolution:

RESOLUTION AWARDS AN ANNUAL BONUS TO NATIONAL GARAGES, INC.
Whereas, The current Agreement between DDA and National Garages, Inc. dated November 9, 1992, as amended, provides in paragraph 4(b) that the DDA shall pay to National Garages, Inc., an additional amount equivalent to no more than 3% of net revenue at the conclusion of each twelve month period if their performance has been to the satisfaction of the DDA;

Whereas, It has been National Garages’ practice to distribute these bonuses to its employees;

Whereas, The DDA Parking Operations Committee has reviewed National Garages’ performance during the past year and has determined that National Garages has performed satisfactorily;

Whereas, The DDA approved bonuses for National Garages in the amount of $20,000.00 in 1997 and 1996;

Resolved, The DDA authorizes a payment in December 1998 of $20,000.00 to National Garages, Inc. as provided for in the agreement between the DDA and National Garages.

Ms. Harshe asked that a list of the recipients of the distributions be given to the DDA prior to the funds being distributed.

A vote on the motion showed:

AYES: Dankert, DeVarti, Fritz, Gunn, Harshe, Pohrt, Relyea, Shaffran, Sipes, Ungrodt
NAYS: None
Absent: Berlin, Gillett

The motion carried.

Ms. Gunn moved and Mr. Ungrodt seconded the following resolution:

Resolution to Approve a Two-Year Contract with National Garages, Inc.

Whereas, The current contract with National Garages expired on November 30, 1998;
Whereas, The Downtown Development Authority solicited proposals from six parking management firms and the City of Ann Arbor to operate the DDA parking system;

Whereas, Five parking management companies submitted proposals and were interviewed by the selection committee, with three companies being selected as finalists;

Whereas, The DDA resolved at its November 1998 meeting to select National Garages as its system operator and to negotiate a new two-year contract; and

Whereas, The DDA Parking Operations Committee has met with representatives of National Garages and has proposed language for a new contract;

RESOLVED, That the Downtown Development Authority accept the language of this proposed new contract with National Garages pending approval by the DDA and City attorneys.

Ms. Gunn reviewed the changes between the old contact and the new contract. Mr. Morehouse reviewed the proposed financial and maintenance forms.

Mr. Pohrt said that he preferred a shorter contract, as it allowed for more dialogue between DDA and National Garages. Mr. Shaffran discussed the possibility of the new Forest Parking Facility not being managed by National Garages and suggested language in the contract to that effect. Mr. Shaffran expressed concern about what would be done to protect the parking membranes during snow plowing. Jerry Billiter stated that the work would be done in accordance with procedures set by Carl Walker Inc. Mr. Billiter went on to explain how rubber edges had been installed on the snowplow blades to protect the membrane but he could not guarantee that no damage would occur. Mr. Dankert asked that the membrane be inspected for damage on a regular basis. Ms. Sipes requested that in addition to a daily and weekly maintenance schedule proposed by DDA staff, that a monthly, biannual and annual maintenance schedule also be included as part of the contract.

A vote on the motion showed:

AYES: Dankert, DeVarti, Fritz, Gunn, Harshe, Pohrt, Relyea, Sipes, Ungrodt
NAYS: Shaffran
Absent: Berlin, Gillett

The motion carried.
Merchant Associations Grant Program
Ms. Relyea reported that she, Ms. Gunn, and Mr. DeVarti had met as a subcommittee to review the South University Area Association (SUAA) proposal for a year-round event schedule, and the joint billboard proposal from the State Street Area Association (SSAA) and Main Street Area Association (MSAA). It was their recommendation to request additional information from the SUAA, and to reject the SSAA/MSAA proposal because it would subsume 60% of the DDA’s merchant grant funds in addition to other concerns about billboards in general.

Ms. Harshe leaves.

After much discussion by the Board concerning the Area Association grants, Mr. Shaffran moved and Mr. DeVarti seconded a motion to give $10,000 from the parking fund general administrative line item and $20,000 from the Area Association Grant item for the funding of the MSAA & SSAA billboard proposal for $30,000. This would leave $30,000 for the SUAA and Kerrytown Area Association proposals.

A vote on the motion showed:

AYES: Dankert, Fritz, Pohrt, Shaffran, Sipes, Ungrod
NAYS: Gunn, DeVarti, Relyea
Absent: Berlin, Gillett, Harshe

The motion failed for lack of a seven-vote majority.

Bike Hoops
Mr. Fritz moved and Ms. Gunn seconded the following resolution:

Resolution to Award $10,000 to the City of Ann Arbor Bicycle Coordinating Committee for the Phase II Installation of Bicycle Racks Throughout the Downtown

Whereas, The DDA Plan directs the DDA to provide for bicycle parking facilities and other alternative transportation options downtown; and
Whereas, The City of Ann Arbor Bicycle Coordinating Committee (BCC) extensively researched bicycle parking needs throughout the DDA area and agreed to work closely with the City Engineering Division throughout their material purchase and installation processes; and

Whereas, The BCC solicited project approval from business owners upon whose sidewalks bicycle hoops were installed as part of their Phase I bicycle parking project and the DDA received no complaints as a result of this project;

Whereas, The DDA has been approached by the BCC with Phase II of their bicycle parking project, which would install an additional 40 bicycle hoops throughout the downtown, including the Kerrytown, Main Street, State Street, and South University areas;

RESOLVED, That the DDA provide the BCC with $10,000 from the 1998/99 DDA budget for the purpose of purchasing and installing up to forty bicycle hoops throughout the downtown.

RESOLVED, That the DDA shall direct the BCC to once again solicit project approval from the business owners upon whose sidewalks bicycle hoops will be installed.

Mr. Ungrodt asked that these hoops not be removable, as hoops were in Phase I. Mr. Fritz said that Phase I hoops had been removable to allow for events such as Art Fair, and because of sidewalk constraints in various locations.

A vote on the motion showed:

AYES: Dankert, DeVarti, Fritz, Gunn, Pohrt, Relyea, Shaffran, Sipes, Ungrodt
NAYS: None
Absent: Berlin, Gillett, Harshe

The motion carried.

Mr. Fritz moved and Ms. Sipes seconded the following resolution:

Resolution Providing $700 for the Downtown Public Arts Committee to Print and Distribute RFP’s Commissioning Public Art for the Fourth & Washington Parking Structure
Whereas, The DDA is underway with the construction of the Fourth & Washington parking structure;

Whereas, Several downtown business owners and residents have formed a volunteer committee promoting the visual arts in the downtown, naming themselves the Downtown Public Arts Committee;

Whereas, This Committee has received offers from two private individuals who will commission artwork to be placed on or beside the new Fourth & Washington parking structure;

Whereas, The Committee has come to the DDA seeking $700 with which to print and distribute Requests for Proposals for artists who will be asked to provide proposals to provide this artwork;

RESOLVED, The DDA awards the Downtown Public Arts Commission $700 from its 063 parking fund with which to print and distribute Requests for Proposals.

A vote on the motion showed:

AYES: Dankert, DeVarti, Fritz, Gunn, Pohrt, Relyea, Shaffran, Sipes, Ungrodt
NAYS: None
Absent: Berlin, Gillett, Harshe

The motion carried.

Parking Construction
Mr. Shaffran moved and Mr. Ungrodt seconded the following resolution:

Resolution to Build the New Forest Parking Structure Above Grade

Whereas, A 1997 parking demand study demonstrated that parking usage in the South University area exceeded 100% of available parking spaces at peak period;

Whereas, City Council approved a footprint for the new structure which will maximize the potential number of parking spaces, thereby enhancing the economic viability and character of the S. University commercial and adjacent residential districts;
Whereas, The University of Michigan has shown an interest in exploring the feasibility of providing parking spaces for its faculty and staff in the new Forest structure in addition to the 591 parking spaces the DDA intends to build for use by the community;

Whereas, A 950-space structure could be built on the new parking structure footprint, providing parking spaces for both UM and community purposes;

Whereas, A 950-space parking structure built with seven levels above grade is estimated to cost $3 million less than a 950-space parking structure built with five levels above and two levels below grade;

Whereas, In addition to the initial construction cost increase there is significant annual energy and equipment cost to operate ventilation, lighting and sprinkling systems below grade;

Whereas, The current Forest structure is six levels above grade;

RESOLVED, The DDA will continue with its plans to construct a parking structure of 591 parking spaces above grade.

RESOLVED, If the University of Michigan chooses to be part of this project, they will be asked to pay the additional amount to build a structure that is 950-spaces including 2 levels below grade.

Mr. DeVarti proposed a friendly amendment asking that if the UM elected to participate in the new structure that it pay all additional costs for constructing more than 591 parking spaces, and that the additional spaces be constructed below grade. The resolution would read as follows:

Resolution to Build the New Forest Parking Structure Above Grade

Whereas, A 1997 parking demand study demonstrated that parking usage in the South University area exceeded 100% of available parking spaces at peak period;

Whereas, City Council approved a footprint for the new structure which will maximize the potential number of parking spaces, thereby enhancing the economic viability and character of the S. University commercial and adjacent residential districts;
Whereas, The University of Michigan has shown an interest in exploring the feasibility of providing parking spaces for its faculty and staff in the new Forest structure in addition to the 591 parking spaces the DDA intends to build for use by the community;

Whereas, A 950-space structure could be built on the new parking structure footprint, providing parking spaces for both UM and community purposes;

Whereas, A 950-space parking structure built with seven levels above grade is estimated to cost $3 million less than a 950-space parking structure built with five levels above and two levels below grade;

Whereas, In addition to the initial construction cost increase there is significant annual energy and equipment cost to operate ventilation, lighting and sprinkling systems below grade;

Whereas, The current Forest structure is six levels above grade;

RESOLVED, The DDA will continue with its plans to construct a parking structure of 591 parking spaces above grade.

RESOLVED, If the University of Michigan chooses to be part of this project, they will be asked to pay the additional amount to build a structure that is 950-spaces including 2 levels below grade.

Ms. Pollay asked for clarification, asking if the DDA was seeking to have the UM pay for all additional costs, as this would have the UM paying more than the City for its proportionate number of parking spaces. Mr. DeVarti affirmed this was the intention.

A vote on the amended motion showed:

AYES: Dankert, DeVarti, Fritz, Gunn, Pohrt, Relyea
NAYS: Shaffran, Sipes, Ungrodt
Absent: Berlin, Gillett, Harshe
The motion failed for lack of a seven-vote majority.

7. Adjournment

As DDA members indicated their need to leave before the agenda could be completed, the meeting was adjourned at 2:15 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Susan Pollay, Executive Director
Secretary