MINUTES
Downtown Development Authority
Thursday, November 12, 1998

Place: DDA Office
301 E. Liberty, Suite 690
Ann Arbor, MI 48104

Time: The Chair, Ed Shaffran, called the meeting to order at 5:05 p.m.

1. Roll Call

| Present: | Neal Berlin, Ron Dankert, David Fritz, Leah Gunn, Maria Harshe, Karl Pohrt, Deanna Relyea, Ed Shaffran, Lorri Sipes |
| Absent: | Dave DeVarti, Bob Gillett, Skip Ungrodt |

| Staff Present: | Susan Pollay, Executive Director |
| Audience: | Joseph Morehouse, Fiscal and Administrative Manager |

| Audience: | Roshanak Ameli, South University Area Association |
| | Jerry Billiter, National Garages |
| | Ray Detter, Citizens Advisory Council |
| | Bob Frazier, National Garages |
| | John Hall, Ann Arbor Observer |
| | Tom Heywood, State Street Area Association |
| | Adrian Iraola, City Engineering |
| | Richard Mitchell, Mitchell and Mouat Architects |
| | Cathy O'Donnell, Ann Arbor News |
| | Jan Onder, Downtown Public Art Committee |
| | Jim Paron, Brown Jug |
| | Ellie Serras, Main Street Area Association |
| | Kent Whiteman, South University Area Association |
| | Andrew L. Wright, Citizens Advisory Council |

2. Approval of Minutes

Ms. Gunn made a motion, and Ms. Harshe seconded, that the minutes of the September 24, 1998 and October 8, 1998 meetings be approved.

A vote on the motion showed:

| AYES: | Berlin, Dankert, Fritz, Gunn, Harshe, Pohrt, Relyea, Shaffran, Sipes |
| NAYS: | None |
| Absent: | DeVarti, Gillett, Ungrodt |

The motion carried.

3. Audience Participation
In response to the DDA’s 1998/99 merchant group grant program, Tom Heywood of the State Street Area Association (SSAA) and Ellie Serras of the Main Street Area Association (MSAA) presented a proposal for billboard advertising on I-94, five miles east of Ann Arbor. The total cost for a one-year commitment was $45,000 and would allow for three design changes throughout the year. The Ann Arbor Area Convention and Visitors Bureau, MSAA and SSAA have each pledged $5,000, leaving a difference of $30,000 for which they request DDA funding.

Mr. DeVarti enters.

Also in response to the DDA’s 1998/99 merchant group grant program, Roshanak Ameli of the South University Area Association (SUAA) presented a proposal to create a program of year-round activities in the S. University area, including walking and bus tours of the area, a summer series of concerts on the pedestrian mall beside the Diag, and a pumpkin walk at Halloween. The SUAA request of the DDA is $24,750 to fund these projects.

Jan Onder and Dick Mitchell of the Downtown Public Art Committee explained their goal of commissioning two art projects on and beside the Fourth & Washington parking structure. They requested that the DDA fund the mailing and copying costs of RFPs from artists. This request was for $700.

Mr. Gillett arrives.

Jim Paron invited everyone to a Sixtieth-Year Anniversary of the Brown Jug, on Thursday the 19th. All offered Mr. Paron congratulations on this important anniversary.

4. Citizens Advisory Council

The Citizens Advisory Council is pleased that the 1998 DDA retreat reaffirmed your commitment to accomplish many of the goals established in last year’s 1997 Retreat “Action Plan.” We look forward to assisting those DDA members and committees that have volunteered to take on the responsibility of working toward achieving those goals. Members of the Citizens Advisory Council, as individuals and as a group, are ready to participate in the work involved and to provide you with public support in your efforts to undertake those public improvements that have greatest impact in strengthening the economic vitality and residential quality of the downtown.

In relationship to that overall goal of both the DDA and the Citizens Council, we strongly believe the economic vitality and residential quality of the downtown are dependent upon the area’s attractiveness as a place for people on foot. Preserving its sense of pedestrian scale, promoting an active street life, and providing a comfortable, interesting and convenient walking environment are essential to maintaining the downtown’s identity and appeal for visitors, shoppers and residents alike. We recognize that the relationship between vehicular traffic and the pedestrian environment must always be carefully assessed. As an example, we have long advocated the location of well-placed art both inside and outside parking structures to communicate a friendly and safe pedestrian environment to arriving and departing motorists.
We believe that Art in Public Places can make an exciting contribution to the downtown pedestrian experience. It enriches the aesthetic quality of the area and, at the same time, expresses and develops the unique culture and vitality of our community. A number of Citizens Council members are committed to a vision and to projects that enhance the character and identity of our downtown as a cultural center for the city and a larger community. We believe that public art should be included as part of all public and private developments in the downtown. The Citizens Council supports DDA financial involvement in partnerships with other areas of government and the private sector to encourage specific streetscape improvements in public art.

In your packet you have a letter and a request from the Downtown Public Art Committee (DPAC) for a token contribution of $700 from the DDA to fund the printing and mailing of RFP's to artists for three privately financed art works in and around the 4th and Washington parking structure. This group has been meeting every week for a year – hundreds of hours – in the belief that the DDA, as indicated in the Action Plan from its 1997 retreat, was committed to “Fourth Avenue pedestrian improvements from Washington Street to Kerrytown in coordination with the new parking structure” and by DDA’s proposed commitment to “make 4th and Washington a model for future structures . . . (and to) . . . incorporate Reuben’s Place.”

From this group came the stimulation and efforts that helped create CAPP the recently established Ann Arbor Commission on Art in Public Places – another DDA 1997 Action Plan goal (“Establish Arts Commission Funding. Activate with new public projects. Art endowment and matching grant fund.”) This is a token request to show your support for a $100,000 privately funded public art project that specifically accomplishes what we all believed were DDA goals. The Citizens Advisory Council very strongly supports your approval of this request.

5. **New Business**

Ms. Harshe, Mr. Pohrt and Ms. Sipes reviewed the new subcommittees generated at the retreat and commented on committee goals, membership, and critical dates those subcommittees needed to meet.

Mr. Pohrt moved and Ms. Sipes seconded the adoption of the subcommittees created at the Annual Retreat, and as shown below, and moved that the work of these groups become the DDA’s work plan for the coming year.

**Parking Operations**

Leah Gunn (chair), Ron Dankert, Maria Harshe, Deanna Relyea

**1998 goals:**

- Upgrade parking facility maintenance.
- Do more to measure customer service, including doing more customer surveys (asking for higher satisfaction levels with each survey)
- Develop a new shorter service contract with more specific expectations and codified NPA quality standards; measure our maintenance/service against competitors (e.g. UM structures)
Housing Issues
Dave DeVarti (Chair), Bob Gillett, Karl Pohrt

1998 goals:
♦ Complete formalizing the DDA housing policy
♦ Write criteria for applications to the DDA housing fund
♦ Design outreach and publicity plan for the housing fund
♦ Recommend annual funding allocation for the housing fund
♦ Participate in the Chamber’s Affordable Housing Symposium in December, 1998

Main/Packard
Bob Gillett (Chair), Maria Harshe, Ed Shaffran, Ray Detter
♦ In 30-60 days, frame a recommendation on whether the DDA supports Sydeco/Kaplan’s TIF proposal, and if so, what DDA support would look like
♦ Within 6 months, develop a new parking policy/model, with criteria for future parking partnerships

Parking Funding and Partnerships
Ed Shaffran (chair), Ron Dankert, Lorri Sipes
♦ Write partnership policy that can cover future relationships (including possibly UM, Dahlmann, other large users, etc.)
♦ Update quarterly the financial plan
♦ Explore different financial scenarios to cover capital costs, including refinancing considerations and maximizing or minimizing debt
♦ Explore alternate funding sources, including City millage, special assessments, bonds, City meter revenues, etc.
♦ As a longer-term project, study downtown parking capacity needs

Shuttle
Lorri Sipes (Chair), Leah Gunn, Deanna Relyea, Ray Detter
♦ Develop financial projections on cost savings by shuttling downtown employees versus building parking structures – create pilot shuttle options for AATA, including target employee bases
♦ Work with AATA to change their negative ad campaigns which discourage people from coming downtown, as well as push them to try more service options, including shuttles and circulators (write letters, attend AATA meetings).
**State Street Project**
Karl Pohrt (Chair), David Fritz, Skip Ungrodt
♦ Report monthly to DDA on UM study
♦ Work on and build the DDA relationship with the UM

**Maintenance Storage Facility**
David Fritz (Chair), Susan Pollay
♦ Work with Adrian Iraola, National Garages to locate sites within parking structures to store extra bricks, light fixtures, etc. for DDA projects

**Fourth Avenue**
David Fritz (Chair), Leah Gunn, Deanna Relyea, Ray Detter
♦ Define scope of improvements and costs for future pedestrian improvements

**Allen Creek**
Bob Gillett (Chair), Lorri Sipes, Paul Dannels (CAC)
♦ Report on the status of the Chamber of Commerce’s analysis of redevelopment opportunities in the Allen Creek area
♦ Frame recommendations to the DDA

**GT Products/First & Washington Recommendation**
Ed Shaffran (Chair), Neal Berlin, Bob Gillett, Lorri Sipes, Ray Detter
♦ Respond to request from GT Products
♦ Frame a decision whether to replace First & Washington parking at current site or at First & William instead
♦ Study Kline’s Lot in relation to this question, determining whether it should be retained for parking or sold for development opportunities

**Recycle / Sell Willard Houses**
Deanna Relyea (Chair)
♦ Evaluate buildings
♦ Study opportunities for moving / reusing houses

**New Urbanism Symposium**
Lorri Sipes (Chair), Karl Pohrt, Ray Detter
Brainstorm with Doug Kelbaugh
♦ Shape symposium involving State Street study representatives (Beckley, etc.) and Venturi Scott Brown master plan team
♦ Explore if this may lead to a future downtown urban design center

Parking Construction
Ed Shaffran (Chair)
♦ Report monthly on status
♦ Oversee Fourth & Washington construction

Bike Hoops
David Fritz (Chair)
♦ Work with Bicycle Coordinating Committee to ascertain possible placement locations, timeline and costs
♦ Come back to DDA with formal proposal

Maintenance
David Fritz (Chair), Skip Ungrodt
♦ Oversee annual downtown spring walkthrough with City staff, area association representatives and downtown residents
♦ Determine possible projects for DDA’s Maintenance Fund
♦ Clarify City/DDA responsibilities (working with Chris Kolb and David Kwan)
♦ Work with City Council to take advantage of additional parking meter revenues to match City funds with DDA funds for downtown maintenance projects
♦ Report on Historic Street Exhibit progress

A vote on the motion showed:

AYES: Berlin, Dankert, DeVarti, Fritz, Gillett, Gunn, Harshe, Pohrt, Relyea, Shaffran, Sipes
NAYS: None
Absent: Ungrodt

Ms. Gunn made a motion to move the time of the December, 1998 and January, 1999 Board Meetings to 12:00 noon on the second Thursday of the month. In order to complete the meetings by 2:00 p.m. the audience participation will be limited to five minutes per speaker. Ms. Harshe seconded.

A vote on the motion showed:
AYES: Berlin, Dankert, DeVarti, Fritz, Gillett, Gunn, Harshe, Pohrt, Relyea, Shaffran, Sipes
NAYS: None
Absent: Ungrodt

6. Subcommittee Reports

Parking Operations Committee Report
Ms. Gunn brought attention to a letter from Jerry Lax, the Authority’s Legal Counsel, which gives his views on upgrading security cameras in the Liberty Square and Maynard Parking structures.

Ms. Gunn moved and Mr. Berlin seconded the following motion:

Resolution to Negotiate a Contract with National Garages

Whereas, The contract with the current parking operator, National Garages will expire on November 30, 1998;

Whereas, The Downtown Development Authority solicited proposals from six firms and the City of Ann Arbor;

Whereas, Five companies submitted proposals and were interviewed by the selection committee, with three companies being chosen as finalists;

Whereas, DDA staff made reference checks and evaluated the operations of the finalists in nearby cities;

Whereas, The selection committee met and recommended that the DDA negotiate a two-year contract with National Garages;

RESOLVED, That the Downtown Development Authority authorize the Executive Director and the Parking Operations Committee Chair to negotiate a two-year contract with National Garages to operate the DDA parking system.

RESOLVED, That the proposed amendment contain a cancellation clause which would allow the DDA to terminate the contract if it so voted.

A vote on the motion showed:

AYES: Berlin, Dankert, DeVarti, Fritz, Gillett, Gunn, Harshe, Pohrt, Relyea, Shaffran, Sipes
NAYS: Shaffran
Absent: Ungrodt
Spaces Between Buildings Steering Committee
Ms. Harshe moved and Mr. Shaffran seconded a motion to discontinue reports from this Committee in light of the motion passed concerning the new committees created at the annual retreat.

A vote on the motion showed:

AYES: Berlin, Dankert, DeVarti, Fritz, Gillett, Gunn, Harshe, Pohrt, Relyea, Shaffran, Sipes
NAYS: None
Absent: Ungrodt

Mr. DeVarti moved and Mr. Gillett seconded a motion to form a subcommittee to handle the Area Association grant proposals. Ms. Gunn will chair the subcommittee, which will also include Ms. Relyea and Mr. DeVarti.

A vote on the motion showed:

AYES: Berlin, Dankert, DeVarti, Fritz, Gillett, Gunn, Harshe, Pohrt, Relyea, Shaffran, Sipes
NAYS: None
Absent: Ungrodt

Finance Committee
Ms. Sipes leaves
Ms. Harshe leaves

Mr. Morehouse reviewed a graph that compares the tickets pulled during 1997 and 1998. He then went through the financial report with the board and explained some of the major variances he observed. Mr. Berlin asked whether the Border’s parking permits were still being paid. Mr. Morehouse reported that they were but their validation account was past due. Mr. DeVarti asked where accounts receivable would be listed on the financial statement. Mr. Morehouse replied that it would affect the income totals since the financial data from National Garages comes in a cash basis form.

Mr. Berlin made a motion and Mr. Pohrt seconded that the accounts receivable information be given to the Board on a monthly basis and that the Executive Director contact Borders about their amount due.

A vote on the motion showed:

AYES: Berlin, Dankert, DeVarti, Fritz, Gillett, Gunn, Pohrt, Relyea, Shaffran
NAYS: None
Absent: Harshe, Sipes, Ungrodt

Ms. Relyea leaves

Parking Construction Committee
Upon motion by Ms. Gunn, with support from Mr. Berlin, the following resolution was put forward:

Resolution to Accept Otis Elevator Company Proposal to Modernize the Ann Ashley Parking Structure Elevators

Whereas, The DDA seeks to enhance its elevator maintenance program to ensure service that best meets the needs of its patrons;

Whereas, Replacement parts for elevator equipment at the Ann Ashley parking structure are no longer available and the elevator equipment must be replaced before a repair program can begin;

Whereas, The DDA received a proposal from Otis Elevator Company to provide and install new machine room equipment, hoistway operating devices, ropes and other equipment for $189,616.00 and this equipment is not included with other elevator repairs in the DDA’s service agreement with Otis;

Whereas, This project will include the installation of a microprocessor system that will continuously monitor usage and performance of the elevators on a 24-hour, year-round basis, and will automatically call for service before service problems arise;

Therefore, The DDA resolves to accept the proposal from Otis Elevator Company to replace obsolete equipment in the Ann Ashley parking structure.

Mr. Shaffran asked that the Board approve the amount but that he would try to negotiate a lower price.

A vote on the motion showed:

AYES: Berlin, Dankert, DeVarti, Fritz, Gillett, Gunn, Pohrt, Shaffran
NAYS: None
Absent: Harshe, Relyea, Sipes, Ungrodt

Upon motion by Ms. Gunn, with support from Mr. Berlin, the following resolution was put forward:

Resolution on Selection of Carl Walker Inc. to Prepare Plans for Repair Package “E” (Maynard Repairs)
Whereas, On August 4, 1997 the City Council approved the DDA parking structure repair plan, which included a full slab replacement of the west half of the Maynard parking structure in addition to other repairs as outlined in a 1997 Carl Walker report;

Whereas, Recent assessments of the Maynard Structure have indicated that these repairs should be undertaken in 1999/2000;

Whereas, Carl Walker Inc. of Kalamazoo, Michigan has provided the DDA with a proposal with a not-to-exceed amount of $247,970 to provide the DDA with Bid Package “E” (Maynard Repairs) services including construction document preparation, bid review, and construction oversight;

Whereas, Said scope of services provides for design and inspection of said repairs, all of which is acceptable to the DDA and the City of Ann Arbor;

Resolved, The DDA accepts the Carl Walker Inc. proposal contained in a letter dated October 1, 1998 addressed to Adrian Iraola, with a not-to-exceed total of $247,970.00.

Mr. Berlin expressed concern that all of the design options that may be desired by the DDA through the architect were not contained in this proposal. Mr. Shaffran expressed his concern over the amount of the contract. Mr. Iraola gave his opinion that the bid was in line with other similar contracts.

A vote on the motion showed:

AYES: Berlin, Dankert, DeVarti, Fritz, Gillett, Gunn, Pohrt, Shaffran
NAYS: None
Absent: Harshe, Relyea, Sipes, Ungrodt

Executive Director Report
Ms. Pollay reported that she would be out of the office the week of Thanksgiving.

7. Adjournment

There being no other business, upon motion, the meeting was adjourned at 7:15 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Susan Pollay, Executive Director
Secretary