

**ANN ARBOR DOWNTOWN DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY MEETING MINUTES**  
**May 6, 2009**

Place: DDA Office, 150 S. Fifth Avenue, Suite 301, Ann Arbor, 48104  
Time: DDA Chair Jennifer Hall called the meeting to order at 12:05 p.m.

<b>1.</b>	<b>ROLL CALL</b>
-----------	------------------

Present: Gary Boren, Russ Collins, Rene Greff, Leah Gunn, Jennifer Hall, Roger Hewitt, John Hieftje, Joan Lowenstein, John Mouat, Keith Orr, Sandi Smith, John Splitt

Absent: None

Staff Present: Susan Pollay, Executive Director  
Joe Morehouse, Deputy Director  
Joan Lyke, Management Assistant

Audience: Peter Allen, Peter Allen & Associates  
Dave Askins, Ann Arbor Chronicle  
Mike Bergren, City of Ann Arbor  
Martha Bayer, City of Ann Arbor  
Pat Cawley, City of Ann Arbor  
Bob Dascola, Downtown Business Owner  
Ray Detter, Downtown Area Citizens Advisory Council  
Kevin Eyer, City of Ann Arbor  
Tyler Erickson, Citizen  
Ray Fullerton, Downtown Area Citizens Advisory Council  
Trek Glowachi, Nerds  
Adrian Iraola, Park Avenue Consultants  
J. Aaron Jacobson, Self  
John Kang, Ross Business School  
Mike Kessler, Workantile Exchange, LLC  
Mark Lyons, Republic Parking System  
Kyle Mazurek, Ann Arbor Chamber of Commerce  
Tom McMurtrie, City of Ann Arbor  
Stephanie Murray, Ann Arbor News  
Ethel Potts, Self  
Connie Pulcifer, City of Ann Arbor  
Ellie Serras, MSAABiz  
Nancy Shore, getDowntown  
Eli Slack, Self  
Mary Thiefels, Tree Town Murals  
Maura Thomson, MSAABiz  
William Toziek, Vague Innovation, LLC  
Brahm Wondeler, Self

<b>2.</b>	<b>AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION</b>
-----------	-------------------------------

Ms. Serras, Ms. Thiefels, Ms. Thomson and Mr. Dascola presented a proposal for an art project, and asked the DDA to extend its 2007 resolution that set aside funds from the 4th & William project for public art in the structure to allow them more time to continue their discussion with the Ann Arbor Public Arts Commission, as the Commission had shown an interest in their project but was unable to come to resolution. Hall referred this issue to the Partnerships Committee as the 2007 resolution had been sponsored by the former DDA ROC committee.

Mr. Cooper said that the cost of the Connector is more expensive than anticipated. AATA would be providing \$320,000 for the study using federal Stimulus funding; the UM will provide \$160,000, and the City & DDA will each be asked to provide \$80,000 for a total \$640,000. The study will examine the feasibility of installing a transportation connection between the UM East Medical Campus, Pfizer campus, North campus, Medical campus, Central Campus, downtown, and Briarwood/Athletic campus areas.

Ms. Shore reported that the 2009 getDowntown Commuter Challenge is off to a great start, with more people and companies participating than ever before. This month-long event provides her with valuable new employee connections and inspires many people to try alternative transportation choices which can translate to long-term commuting changes. The Zipcar program is going very well and the DDA may soon be asked to increase the number of cars it sponsors.

Mr. Glowachi said that he was a soft-ware developer, doesn't own a car and doesn't park downtown but he felt that the DDA blocking parking data access creates bad feelings with local technology groups and is an affront on the societal level. Ms. Greff reported that access was readily made available months ago; Ms. Pollay asked to meet with Mr. Glowachi to learn more about why he felt access was still being blocked.

### 3. REPORTS FROM CITY BOARDS AND COMMISSIONS

Downtown Area Citizens Advisory Council: Mr. Detter extended an invitation to the Old Fourth Ward & Downtown Neighbors Spring Potluck Party, 120 & 126 N. Division, on June 4<sup>th</sup>. He said that CAC is concerned about negative conditions at Courthouse Square Apartments as reported by residents, and will attempt to help as possible. The CAC does not believe the City should use the DDA parking funds to balance its budget; these funds should be used to sustain and improve the quality of life downtown. CAC opposes extending meters into the residential areas. The CAC will continue to follow the A2D2 project.

### 4. PRESENTATIONS

Ms. Pulcipher presented a handout of the new Citizen Participation Ordinance Guide for PUDs, Planned Projects, Rezoning and Major Site Plans. The guide was created by the Planning Unit to help developers meet the ordinance requirements for citizen participation. Mr. Eyre provided a demonstration of a new web program developed in partnership with the Planning Unit and IT Staff which allows citizens to track development projects through the city system. Citizens may sign up to receive an e-mail alert whenever a new development is proposed; they can click on a live map to see where the project is and how it relates to the surrounding area and they can attend meetings related to the project(s). The new technology does not replace public hearing notices via regular mail but it is more convenient and up to date. Ms. Pulcipher said in the future the Planning unit may use other technologies for notifying citizens about projects such as Facebook and/or Tweeter.

Mr. McMurtrie stated the City is going to replace 75 trash cans with receptacles that work with the automated solid waste trucks, with 50 placed in city parks and 25 placed downtown. He understood the concerns about the automated cans being lighter and thus more likely to be tipped over. Mr. Collins asked why the DDA was being informed about this; Mr. McMurtrie said that he welcomed DDA comments. Mr. Collins thanked him for allowing this involvement, saying that "this was really nice."

Mr. Bergren presented an overview of two revenue-generating ideas that were included in the FY 2009/10 and FY 2010/11 City budgets. One was a new permit for commercial vehicles that use the loading zones. The cost of the permits would depend on the delivery area(s) requested. The second idea was to install new parking meters in the close-in residential areas just outside the DDA District, near the hospital, and in areas such as on Depot and Wall Streets where there is commuter parking taking place. Mr. Bergren said that it was estimated that \$380,000 would be generated for the city from these meters.

### 5. STATUS OF CITY TASKFORCE EFFORTS WITH DDA MEMBERSHIP

A2D2 Steering Committee: Mr. Hewitt reported that City Council will soon consider amendments to the Downtown Plan which were proposed by the Planning Commission to incorporate the vision and recommendations of the A2D2 initiative into the master plan. Following that, City Council is scheduled to consider the A2D2 zoning amendments. The A2D2 Steering Committee and the Planning Commission will continue working on the urban design guidelines and a design review process for new downtown development, with public review of these guidelines tentatively scheduled for fall.

415 W. Washington: Mr. Mouat said this item has been placed on hold while City Staff has focused on the Budget process. He expects staff to resume working on this item after the City budget is approved.

Mutually Beneficial Agreement Committee: Ms. Greff stated that the committee did not meet this month.

<b>6. MINUTES</b>
-------------------

Ms. Gunn moved and Mr. Orr seconded approval of the April 1, 2009 DDA meeting minutes.

**A vote on the motion to approve the minutes showed:**

**AYES:** Boren, Collins, Greff, Gunn, Hall, Hewitt, Hieftje, Lowenstein, Mouat, Orr, Smith, Splitt

**NAYS:** None

**Absent:** None

**The motion carried.**

<b>7. PARTNERSHIPS COMMITTEE</b>
----------------------------------

Energy Audits: Ms. Smith shared the most recent energy audit summary prepared by Mr. Konkle. The first audit of a large building (First National Bank Building) was received.

Mid-year Retreat: The retreat will take place May 20<sup>th</sup> on the Michigan Theater stage. The first half will focus on the DDA mission and parking agreement. The second half will showcase project ideas that could be undertaken in downtown Ann Arbor.

DDA Percent for the Arts: Ms. Smith said the Committee explored the idea of redirecting DDA Percent for the Arts funds to downtown performing arts buildings to help address maintenance concerns as a way to help them withstand the current economic situation. There appeared to be no interest in this concept; rather the committee may explore other ideas such as paying for energy saving improvements.

DDA website: Ms. Smith reported that the Committee is reviewing website content and structure.

Sidewalk recycle containers: Ms. Smith said that the DDA provided funding last year for a pilot program. At the time containers weren't readily available through catalogues so a local dumpster firm designed the 9 units that were installed. There is an interest in increasing the number of containers, and the committee will discuss the possibility of a design competition to create more attractive and unique containers as well as the possibility of purchasing through a catalogue, before bringing a funding request to the DDA.

<b>8. TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE</b>
------------------------------------

Mr. Mouat said that the Committee held a moveable meeting which began with a LINK ride followed by a walk back to the office and finished with a discussion about the DDA's role with "shared transportations" and "personal transportations." Committee observations included the lack of information at LINK stops, the number of women using the LINK, and the significant demographic change on the LINK in the "town" and "gown" parts of downtown. Other observations included: the more people and activity, the less one notices if downtown looks dirty, the LINK use connecting Oxford Housing to central campus was very clear – less clear is the benefit to making the full large circuit and perhaps the route should be broken into two. Mr. Mouat invited all DDA members to a special meeting to discuss the LINK, May 7, 11 am.

**9. OPERATIONS COMMITTEE**

Transition to Demand Management: Mr. Hewitt reported that the pilot Maynard valet program is still being monitored, the pilot AVI program is now in its third month, the multi-space pay stations are delayed again due to the backlog demand for solar panels meanwhile the parking space marker design is being tweaked, and the new customer service telephone service is now in its second month.

Financial statements: Mr. Hewitt reported that TIF expenses are over budget due to the unbudgeted grant to the City for the court/police building, direct parking expenses is over budget due to additional staff time for TDM efforts, parking revenues are nearly equal to budget.

Meter bag fee waivers: Mr. Hewitt said that staff had been asked to provide a report which showed that the DDA provided \$152,115 in meter bag fee waivers in the past year. Approximately 1/3 of this was provided to support Art Fair, another large amount went toward bagging meters on football Saturdays to accommodate game traffic, as well as waivers for nonprofits.

Official parking placards: Mr. Hewitt said that effective September 1<sup>st</sup> the Committee has decided to terminate use of a little known "official parking placard" program inherited many years ago from the city. Current users will be provided with the option to receive prepaid stored value parking meter cards with a token value of \$5 which can be reloaded with additional value at the Republic Parking office.

Grant approvals: Mr. Hewitt said that the committee was considering asking that all grants recommended by other DDA committees should first be reviewed by the Operations Committee before the full DDA would consider them, or alternately that the budget should be organized to assign funds to each committee and any additional dollars recommended by a committee would have to be reviewed first by the Operations committee. Ms. Greff said that she though this concept gave more power to one committee over the others and that every DDA member should consider the impacts to the Ten Year Plan before approving large grants. Ms. Gunn said she agreed with Mr. Hewitt that Operations Committee should review grant recommendations from the other committees. Ms. Greff said that this would be an abrupt change in DDA procedures and culture to empower one committee over the others. Mr. Collins said that he understood the issue under debate was that grants were approved that had not been budgeted so maybe it would be a good idea to give each committee a budgeted amount for grants. Ms. Hall said she thought that large projects had as much if not more impact than grants. Ms. Smith indicated she did not see the problem that would prompt such a change in the grant approval process.

**7. CAPITAL IMPROVEMENTS COMMITTEE**

Wayfinding: Mr. Splitt reported that the project is out to bid and responses are due shortly. The committee will bring a resolution to the May 20<sup>th</sup> retreat for contractor approval. Interest is strong and we hope for good prices.

5<sup>th</sup> & Division: Mr. Splitt said that a city staff member recently provided an additional set of comments on the construction drawings which Beckett & Raeder will incorporate. A meeting will be held this evening at the Michigan Union to provide interested residents/businesses on Division Street information about construction this summer. This meeting is being held at the Michigan Union because the UM will also be providing information on its new parking structure construction on Division Street that has already begun and the City will provide information on their street resurfacing project on Packard in August including an area adjacent to Division Street. It is anticipated that the 5<sup>th</sup> & Division project will be out to bid by the end of May.

S. Fifth Avenue Parking Structure Project: Design detailing continues and the committee will be updated at its next meeting. The environmental soils report came back clean; Mr. Iraola will apply for administrative approvals from the City to transport soils to the airport. Discussions regarding infrastructure relocation continue with DTE, AT & T and Comcast. Utility easement descriptions have been developed. In

coordination with the City's resurfacing work on E. Liberty Street, installation of the conduit work by DTE at 5<sup>th</sup> and Liberty is scheduled to begin tomorrow.

<b>10. OTHER DDA BUSINESS MATTERS</b>
---------------------------------------

City Parking Meters: Ms. Hall brought back for discussion the matter of the City including in its budget an assumption of new parking meter revenues. She thanked Mr. Bergren and Mr. Cawley for their assistance during this discussion. Mr. Bergren said that the plan for the City to install new parking meters is a proposal and there is still time for discussion before the City Council votes on this in two weeks.

Ms. Smith expressed concern that this plan shows meters installed in residential areas and that the revenue projections may be too high given what she had seen when meters were installed on N. Ashley and N. First Street where commuters simply parked elsewhere rather than pay to park at these meters.

Mr. Bergren was asked if the city would use parking meters or kiosks; he said they planned to use parking meters, possibly buying them from the DDA when they are being removed for pay-by-space kiosks. Mr. Boren asked if the City would be asking the DDA to manage these additional meters; Mr. Bergren said that this hadn't been determined yet. Mr. Boren said that he thought that the City and DDA should discuss this question along with other parking-related issues. Ms. Hall asked how parking enforcement would work since the proposed budget would eliminate most of the city's parking enforcement positions and these meters would greatly expand the area enforcement would be needed; Mr. Bergren indicated that he wasn't able to address this question.

Ms. Smith stated that adding meters in residential areas where there is free parking now will likely just push parking out further into the neighborhoods. Ms. Greff said the issue of dual management of parking meters was complicated. She said that she was grateful that the City would not be adding meters within the DDA District, but that Nelson/Nygaard set forward a recommendation that all public parking should be managed by the DDA. Mr. Mouat asked if there was a way for the DDA to discuss this with the City. Ms. Greff said that the City had not appointed its ad hoc "mutually beneficial" committee yet. Mr. Hieftje said that City Council is not planning on appointing its committee before the budget is approved.

Ms. Lowenstein said that the Executive Committee discussed the matter and drafted a resolution to help the DDA frame its thoughts on the idea. Ms. Lowenstein moved and Mr. Splitt seconded the following resolution:

**RESOLUTION REQUESTING THAT CITY COUNCIL RECONSIDER THE ACTION OF ADDING PUBLIC PARKING METERS AS PART OF ITS 2009/10 AND 2010/11 BUDGETS**

Whereas, The A2DDA has managed the off-street public parking system since 1992 and the on-street metered parking system since 2002 for a combined public parking system of approximately 7,100 parking spaces;

Whereas, The DDA and City work together to ensure the public benefit from this parking system under the 2002 Parking Agreement;

Whereas, It has been proposed that the City's 2009/10 and 2010/11 budgets include a \$380,000 figure for new revenues to be received by the City from new parking meters that will be installed in locations adjacent to DDA-managed meters, as well as in distant locations such as on Washtenaw;

Whereas, as managers of the public parking system the DDA is skeptical that the City will in fact generate \$380,000 (net of expenses) from the new meters;

Whereas, Dual management of two different on-street meter systems will be confusing and a duplication of services for the public and counter to Nelson/Nygaard's recommendation that all public parking be provided

by the DDA to meet the goals of demand management;

RESOLVED, The DDA asks that the City reconsider the plan to install many dozens of new parking meters as part of its 2009/10 and 2010/11 budget approvals;

RESOLVED, The DDA suggests that this would be an excellent topic of discussion for the "Mutually Beneficial" subcommittees of DDA and City to discuss when they meet to discuss the January 2009 City Council resolution requesting that the DDA engage in a dialogue with the City to determine mutually beneficial opportunities to direct new funds to the City.

Ms. Smith said that she supported this resolution. She said that she was skeptical of the revenue projections included in the proposed city budget and felt that this topic should be part of a larger discussion between the City and the DDA about parking. She said that she felt that the parking system needs to be managed as an organic system rather than in bits and parts. She said she also would favor residential permits rather than the installation of parking meters in the residential areas.

Ms. Lowenstein said that she also thought the parking system should be operated as whole system. The DDA is piloting a project to move away from meters toward kiosks and pay-by-space system. The City's plan seems contrary to the DDA plan. This issue deserves discussion before the City moves forward with the plan as proposed in the budget.

Mr. Boren said he had some concerns with regard to the legality of the proposal to add meters given the current parking contract between the City and DDA. Ms. Lowenstein proposed an amendment that was considered as friendly to add the words, "by contract" to the first Whereas. She also proposed a Resolved clause that the "DDA would add this item to its midyear retreat agenda for discussion," which was also considered as friendly.

Ms. Greff asked what the Board hoped to achieve by the amendments to the resolution. Mr. Collins stated he would support the resolution but he didn't feel it would make a difference. Mr. Hieftje requested the item be assigned to Partnerships for further discussion. Mr. Orr suggested the item should be discussed by the City and DDA Mutually Beneficial committees; Ms. Greff agreed, saying that this item should be considered as part of the larger parking discussions between the City and the DDA. Ms. Gunn expressed concern with the benign nature of the resolution.

Mr. Hieftje asked that the final resolved clause direct this topic to the DDA Partnerships Committee rather than the Mutually Beneficial Committee, as Partnerships also has City Council members participating. This was considered to be a friendly amendment.

Ms. Hall said she was disappointed the Mutually Beneficial Committee was excluded; Ms. Greff expressed disappointment that City Council directed the DDA to begin a dialogue about parking revenues in January and many months later still had not appointed its committee to begin this discussion.

The amended resolution is as follows:

**RESOLUTION REQUESTING THAT CITY COUNCIL RECONSIDER THE ACTION OF ADDING PUBLIC PARKING METERS AS PART OF ITS 2009/10 AND 2010/11 BUDGETS**

Whereas, The A2DDA has managed the off-street public parking system by contract since 1992 and the on-street metered parking system since 2002 for a combined public parking system of approximately 7,100 parking spaces;

Whereas, The DDA and City work together to ensure the public benefit from this parking system under the 2002 Parking Agreement;

Whereas, It has been proposed that the City's 2009/10 and 2010/11 budgets include a \$380,000 figure for new revenues to be received by the City from new parking meters that will be installed in locations adjacent to DDA-managed meters, as well as in distant locations such as Washtenaw;

Whereas, As managers of the public parking system the DDA is skeptical that the City will in fact generate \$380,000 (net of expenses) from the new meters;

Whereas, Dual management of two different on-street meter systems will be confusing and a duplication of services for the public and counter to Nelson/Nygaard's recommendation that all public parking be provided by the DDA to meet the goals of demand management;

RESOLVED, The DDA asks that the City reconsider the plan to install many dozens of new parking meters as part of its 2009/10 and 2010/11 budget approvals;

RESOLVED, The DDA suggests that this would be an excellent topic of discussion for the Partnerships Committee.

RESOLVED, The DDA will add this matter to its midyear retreat agenda for discussion, and will make a recommendation about this at an upcoming DDA meeting.

**A vote to approve the resolution as amended showed:**

**AYES: Boren, Collins, Greff, Gunn, Hall, Hewitt, Hieftje, Lowenstein, Mouat, Orr, Smith, Splitt**

**NAYS: None**

**Absent: None**

**The motion carried.**

Mr. Hieftje reported that the Police Chief will be presenting information about how parking enforcement will be handled in light of the elimination of many community standards positions in the upcoming budgets. He will also present information to the next Mayor's Downtown Marketing Task Force meeting on how the downtown may be impacted by the elimination of the downtown beat officers.

Mr. Hieftje announced that SEMCOG anticipates opening the East-West Commuter Rail service October 23, 2010. The North-South rail discussions continue.

Ms. Smith stated that the recently approved Transportation Plan related to WALLY listed the LINK as a possible shuttle connector. More details to follow.

<b>11. OTHER AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION</b>
---

None.

<b>12. ADJOURNMENT</b>
------------------------

Mr. Hewitt moved and Mr. Splitt seconded adjournment of the meeting at 2:20 PM.

Respectfully submitted,  
Susan Pollay, Executive Director